



Linguistics and Literature Review (LLR)

Volume 5, Issue 2, October 2019

Journal DOI: <https://doi.org/10.32350/llr>

Issue DOI: <https://doi.org/10.32350/llr.52>

ISSN: 2221-6510 (Print) 2409-109X (Online) Journal homepage: <http://journals.umt.edu.pk/llr/Home.aspx>

Shadow of the Father: Evidence of Electra Complex in Benazir Bhutto's *Daughter of the East*

Isma Tariq

To cite to this article: Isma Tariq (2019). Shadow of the Father: Evidence of Electra Complex in Benazir Bhutto's *Daughter of the East*, *Linguistics and Literature Review* 5(2): 89- 105.

To link to this article:

Published online: October 31, 2019

Article QR Code:



Isma Tariq



A publication of the
Department of English Language and Literature
School of Social Sciences and Humanities
University of Management and Technology
Lahore, Pakistan

Shadow of the Father: Evidence of Electra Complex in Benazir Bhutto's *Daughter of the East*

Isma Tariq

The University of Lahore- Lahore, Pakistan

ABSTRACT

This paper aims at exploring the symptoms of Electra complex in Benazir Bhutto through her autobiography *Daughter of the East* (1988). As developed by Freud, psychoanalysis provides an insight into the conflicts that are believed to lie at the roots of people's problems. His discovery of the unconscious mind led him to believe that all dreams, jokes, slips of tongues, thoughts, behavior and action have hidden meanings, and suggest the psychic structures of the mind shape the personality. The researcher uses this theory to explore the symptoms of Electra complex in Benazir's personality. This paper proves that *Daughter of the East* contains evidence of certain symptoms which prove that Benazir suffered from Electra complex. Specific strategies of narratological analysis are selected for analyzing and interpreting textual evidence. This paper throws light on the deep-seated anxieties that exerted continuous pressure on Benazir's mind. Through this analysis, the researcher has found symptoms of Electra complex in Benazir Bhutto. Benazir was so deeply in love with her father that she was unable to focus on her own life in her autobiography. She was obsessed with her love for her father and revered him as a saint. Benazir even developed a sense of competition with her siblings for the love of her father. The researcher argues that Benazir recreated her traumatic past, her father's images, and his memories by writing her autobiography.

Keywords: Electra complex, trauma, obsessed love, rivalry, narcissism

Introduction

This paper focuses on the symptoms of Electra complex confirmed through an in-depth analysis of *Daughter of the East* (1988) in the personality of Benazir Bhutto. Electra complex is a psychoanalytic theory that recognizes different aspects of father fixation. Benazir had a deep, abiding love and concern for her father. Owing to the traumatic effects of her father's death, she idolized her father as a saint. Therefore, psychoanalysis would help to expose the reality of Benazir's complex.

Freud considered childhood as a crucial stage of life as a child explores the world and his impression of life sets. According to him, complexities of one psychosexual stage have to be

resolved in order to enter the next phase successfully. Allowing little and too much gratification at a stage might lead to fixation at it.

According to Freud, Electra complex contains emotions and ideas that are kept in the unconscious mind through forceful repression that concentrate upon a girl's desire to sexually possess her father (Cherry, 2019). Girls can get rid of this complex through identification with the parent of the same gender.

Electra complex originates from Greek myth where Electra along with her brother Orestes plotted against her mother Clytemnestra to avenge the murder of her father, Agamemnon. She wandered lonely around the palace moaning and cursing. She did not want to have any sexual relationship. Taking revenge was the only goal of her life for which she sacrificed her youth and beauty.

The Greeks believed that "The misdeeds of an individual could be visited on his descendants for five generations" (Adkins as cited in Willner, 1982: 3). However, Freud and his followers concluded that "each generation transfers its psychic disposition to the next" (as cited in Willner, 1982: 62). According to Jones it can be defined as "[...] a man who displace an abnormally strong attraction for his daughter also gives evidence of a strong ...fixation in regard to his mother..." (as cited in Wilner, 1982: 62). "For many a man hath seen himself in dreams his mother's mate, but he who gives no heed to such like matters bears the easier life" (Sophocles, :130). Despite this Oedipus is not detested by many psychoanalysts who believe that this is so because people view Oedipus story as their own wish fulfillment.

According to feminists, women who were considered less than men, their job was to stay in domestic sphere and they only acted when they needed to like Electra in *The Orestes* and Antigone in *Oedipus Saga*. They lost their femininity and their feminine role was reversed. These women did not want to marry and remained childless as they were satisfied in their relationships with their fathers and brothers.

Freud believed that different phobias have their roots in some long-forgotten traumatic experiences of the patient. (Thornton, n.d., Life, para. 2) Such afflicted persons may keep quiet and repress their thoughts into the subconscious, where if they are allowed to go unchecked, will continue to affect these people well into adulthood.

Jill Scott in his book "*Electra after Freud: Myth and Culture*" writes that initially Freud considered Electra complex as a simple term as girls do not have castration anxiety but afterwards claimed it to be more complex due to the shift in sexual object. Scott stresses that Jung did not define the term clearly. Scott analyzes Electra adaptations in twentieth century literature by Sylvia Plath in *Daddy* (1965) and Eugene O' Neil's *Mourning becomes Electra* (1931), etc.

Some psychoanalysts consider that Oedipus and Electra complex develop due to abnormal societal, familial and individual reasons. Borovečki-Jakovljević & Matačić (2005) in their article "*The Oedipus Complex in the Contemporary Psychoanalysis*" focus on various perspectives of theorists such as Sigmund Freud, Carl Jung, Melanie Klein, Margaret Mahler, Georges Devereux, Heinz Kohut, Thomas Ogden, and Kulish and Holtzman. These psychoanalysts consider the issues of phallic stage (Oedipus and Electra) as universal. Klein stresses that in both genders early stage

Oedipus complex are very similar. She also stresses the triangle relation of family in which a child has the capacity to tolerate both parents. All these theorists consider parents' role can pass the child or may give him a fix. Absence of father and even mother can generate this complex. The unconcerned attitude of parents can give rise to an Electra complex.

Sofe Ahmed in her thesis on D.H Lawrence's *Sons and Lovers* proves that Paul's complex was the outcome of his unhealthy maternal relation with his mother. Dr. Valentine emphasizes that there is just fluctuation in affection for the parent of the opposite gender that depends on necessity. Therefore, there is no fix for a child at any developmental stage.

Freud (2010) in her book "*Electra vs Oedipus: The drama of the Mother- Daughter Relationship*" relates the disturbances that occur in the lives of daughters owing to their feelings of hatred for their mothers. Freud (2010) has used mythical Electra as an example to show the conflicts that women face during their developmental stages. The relation of mother and daughter can be symbiosis in which girls continue with their mothers' image and cannot assert their own identity, or total separation which is also an unhealthy relation. As a result of total separation girls transfer their attention to their fathers. Either father is missed, idolized or too little involved. Freud thinks that observation of everyday life can give a more detailed perspective of Electra complex.

Oedipus complex and Electra complex are very much an integral part of Literature. Writers have used these complexes to speak the minds of their characters, to interpret different personality traits and social, individual, and familial issues that give rise to neurosis. O' Neil's *Mourning Becomes Electra* (1931), Vladimir Nabokov's *Lolita* (1955), Sylvia Plath's *Daddy* (1965), The *Colossus* (1960), *The Beekeeper's Daughter* (1942) and *The Full Fathom Five* (1958), Sexton's *The Moss of His Skin* (1988), *All My Pretty Ones* (1962), *And One for My Dame* (1960) all present Electra complex covertly or overtly.

Electra has existed through histories including diverse cultures and civilizations, presenting the everlasting stories of stepmothers expressing their grudges. Snow-White and Cinderella are two of the famous stories among youth which perceive the character of stepmother as wicked and cruel. A few clinicians believe that the preconceived idea of stepmother is often used by youngsters as an outlet for the anger and dislike that they feel towards their biological mothers (Haider & Khan, 2015: 1).

Shakespeare's *Twelfth Night* presents the psychosexual love of two girls Viola and Olivia for their brothers as a replacement of the father figure. A complete struggle of the girls through pre-phallic, phallic and genital is presented in the play. Association and disassociation are important factors in Electra complex. These girls repress their thoughts due to the fear of the society. They do not mention their mother. Olivia mourns her brother's death and considers it a loss of her own identity. A lower class husband appeals Olivia for the continuity of her narcissism.

Twelfth Night mirrors certain symbols of Benazir' autobiography such as the ring transferred to Benazir by her father, her extra ordinary association with her father's home, her rare mentioning of her mother, her sad state of mind at the death of her brother, and her choice to marry a man with low status.

According to Freud, women begin to replace the wish for the male organ with the wish for a baby and for this purpose another male is equated with father. (Offerman-Zuckerberg, 2013) O'Neil's play *Mourning Becomes Electra* is replete with these psychological issues. O'Neil has chosen two Greek plays to adapt in the modern psychological tragedy, Aeschylus' *The Oresteia* and Sophocles' *The Oedipus*. Electra is often linked to (Elektra) which means "without wed lock". Both girls (Lavinia and Electra) refused to marry as they replaced castration envy with the want for a baby. For them the baby was replaced by their brothers Orin and Orestes. As they were daddies' sons, Lavinia and Electra bestowed their love on their brothers. Both Orin and Orestes were moved to action because of their jealousy. These girls lamented not only their father's absence but also faced ignorance from their mothers.

Electra complex is visible in Sylvia Plath's life and works. Plath has drawn comparisons between her father and her husband in *Daddy*. This poem has many similes and metaphors disturbing enough to make the reader attentive. There remains a confused feeling for the reader whether Plath wants to appreciate or depreciate her father. Plath says in an interview that the narrator of the poem has Electra complex. She shares that her father's death was shocking for her because she thought him omnipotent. She also states the fact that the strain of having a Nazi father and a Jewish mother affected her negatively. Ghasemi & Changizi describe Plath's note (as cited in Zayani, 2017: 32) Confessional poets like to highlight their personal matters, mental anguish, and suicidal impulses (Abrams & Harpham, 2011: 62).

Lolita by Vladimir Nabokov presents trauma theory as the real cause of the Electra complex. Past experiences affected the future behaviours of the characters, Humbert and Lolita. Kendra Cherry in her article "The Electra Complex" suggests that defense mechanism plays an important role in the release of the complex. (2018) Freud considered it a cathartic activity to recall the experience. Either through therapy or writing, a person comes to terms with these emotions.

Autobiographies are subjective works. Psychologically speaking, autobiographies do have the capacity and tendency to mislead due to the writer's avoidance of the unwanted data.

Allen (2016) in her book *Favored Daughter* mentions the powerful women in the political history of the subcontinent. Among them is the great Fatima Jinnah who stood in opposition to Ayub Khan. The daughter of Mujibur Rehman, Sheikh Hasina Wajed, also controlled the office for more than four decades. Indra Ghandi, as the torch-bearer of her father, succeeded in changing the political picture of India significantly. Benazir Bhutto herself ruled and stayed influential for a significant period.

Both women were blindly devoted to their fathers. Their fathers completely dominated their minds and thoughts even after death. (Versey, 2007) They were self-centered and were afraid to lose their position. "There is no doubt that both these women had their ears to the ground; as opposed to the sons of the soil, they were the mothers of the earth." (Versey, 2007) Symbolically speaking, the wish of an Electra complex gets apparent in her efforts to incorporate her father's ideology. Both these women got married to the persons low in rank that speaks for their narcissism. "She had the largest Electra complex of any female politician in modern history, entirely consecrated to the memory of her executed father" (Hitchens, 2007). Even a common reader

response shows the misogyny on Hitchens' comments. Grey Wolf, a common reader, comments on Hitchens slate article that "Benazir was not an ordinary name to be titled as an Electra complex" (2007).

"She had an Electra complex. But was her complex strong enough to wish this upon her 19 -year -old son." Zardari declared that his son's name was changing from Bilawal Zardari to Bilawal Bhutto Zardari ("Third Time A Charm," 2007).

Ian Buruma in her review of *Daughter of the East* as a political autobiography commends Benazir's struggle to avenge her father. Her struggle shapes Benazir's autobiography as a classical myth. Buruma says that this is not a simple autobiography but a complete political autobiography with a political message for generations.

Rebecca Reid in her review of *Daughter of the East* emphasizes that Benazir's political purpose was to inform the West of what was happening in her country. Reid also comments that certainly General Zia made her life challenging but he was not responsible for every single decision that she made (Reid, 2010). Reid comments that *Daughter of the East* presents biased opinions. It gives a frustrating data with serious flaws in the text.

This research proves that Benazir seems to be patterned on her father's in her autobiography. She always judged people by their past and the connection they had with her father (Gupta 2004: 119). She thus continuously remained trapped in past, refusing to let go an idealized image of her father. Benazir's main concern in seeking her father's attention might be something that was disturbing for her, making her feel insecure and thus causing her to seek protection in her father. Despite the differences of opinions regarding her complex, it is evident that her association with her father was rather complex and requires further deliberation in order to be fully understood.

Research Methodology

Through textual analysis of *Daughter of the East* an attempt has been made to show that like a girl with an Electra complex, Benazir Bhutto tried to be the only focus of her father's love and did not want to share his love with her mother. The research also establishes that Benazir Bhutto's anxiety drove her to repress her feelings. Freud believed that girls suffering from Electra complex do not express their emotions overtly and this creates a sense of doubt and confusion. Further, Electra complex girls show some important symptoms.

- Girls having Electra complex constantly recall their father when happy or sad.
- They feel hostile towards their mothers. Sometimes they imagine their mothers to disappear and cherish to live with their fathers.
- Women with Electra complex are afraid of their traumatic thoughts and have recurring dreams of their fathers.
- A very common symptom is that these girls take their fathers' side in a quarrel, not mothers'.
- They take decisions in accordance with their fathers' wishes or examples.

- They feel difficulty in regulating relations with others. Usually this symptom occurs due to a woman's inability to find a husband who resembles her perfect father. Even if a man does not have any vivid disadvantages, she will still try to leave him.
- They try to remain the focus of their fathers' attention.
- They feel the lack of attention and care. Thus, they rarely feel happy.
- They want to exercise power over others through their intellect, talent and other outstanding qualities (Kaufman, 2011).

The above given symptoms are traced in the autobiographical narrative of Benazir Bhutto *Daughter of the East* to conclude that the manner in which Benazir presents her worries, emotional breakdowns, and feelings shows that she had certain repressed memories. She recalled her father religiously. This research has also traced abruptness in plot structure as evidence that Benazir Bhutto was unable to concentrate and always jumped back to the memories of her father. What he said, what he did, she needed to repeat it as if she were a person obsessed with his life and legacy. This method of textual analysis highlights the narratives where Benazir Bhutto herself admitted that she loved her father the most. She never placed anybody in her father's place even when he was dead. She felt uneasy with her mother and drew comparisons between her mother and her father and always found her father more updated and convenient. She has shown a few moments in her autobiography of her own happiness as a person.

Thus for a comprehensive understanding of Benazir Bhutto's Electra complex following questions were made to direct the researcher.

- What evidence is present in *Daughter of the East* to suggest that Benazir Bhutto suffered from Electra complex?
- Does *Daughter of the East* reveal any friction in the relation of Benazir with her mother?
- How does Benazir Bhutto present herself as more important and cherished child than her siblings?
- How does Benazir present that her father guided her in all the matters? Therefore, her decisions were actually her father's decisions.
- How was her father a role model for her due to the Electra complex?
- How does Benazir Bhutto present her father as the first love of her life who cannot be replaced?
- How does Benazir Bhutto present her emotional dependence on her father?

Analysis

Her autobiography shows that her whole life was like a dress rehearsal for the main act which was to avenge her father. She wanted to return her family the power which they had (Burma, 2007). The whole autobiography is set in an action and reaction plot. *Daughter of the East* presents Zulfikar Ali Bhutto as almost perfect while his villains as cunning strategists. Her father's political murder and her own confinement were such painful experiences that they became a permanent part of her narrative. Her emotional reactions are also readable through constant mix ups in the text. At times she even fails to fill in the blanks. In fact, wherever she is unable to describe and

explain her own choices, she uses her father's examples to fill in the blanks, showing how difficult it is for her to separate her life from her father.

Mary Anne Weaver said, "She's a chameleon. She can be anything." With such an impressive attire, Benazir is not an easy name to be designated as an example of Electra complex. This research tries to find the symptoms given above in *Daughter of the East* to establish the contention that Benazir Bhutto did have an Electra complex.

Obsessive Love for Father

According to an anonymous writer: "The first true love any daughter has is her father. No one will ever replace him as the love of her life." Benazir also confesses her love for her father while writing about her anxiety at the time when she had just half an hour to say goodbye to the person she loved the most (Bhutto, 1988: 9). This tender feeling might be the result of extra care taken by the father during her early years. According to John Bowlby, "attachment bond" is a time taking process developed through communications. This communication was so easily going between Benazir and her father and it brought them closer. She mentions her father explaining his angry behavior. Her father wanted to save her from every harm (Bhutto, 1988: 93). Austin believes that dads should ask forgiveness when necessary to show respect and love to their daughters. This gesture definitely heals the inevitable hurts in the daily life (as cited in McGolerick, 2017). Her love for her father, Benazir writes herself, made her superstitious as she saw the death of her pets as an omen of her father's death (Bhutto, 1988: 117).

This type of women having a superstitious attitude reads strange. Death is a natural phenomenon and it was no big deal if some animal died before her father's assassination. She idolized him to the level of obsession as she could not see what was wrong in him. She was delighted by her father's retort and considered him an open person when he openly declared his habit to take an occasional drink after an eighteen hour workday (Bhutto, 1988: 69). Her stance to keep a positive approach towards her father was absolutely right but she showed an inability to take a stand for the right. She was so blind on account of her idealism that she forgot that she was a public figure and an upcoming leader of an Islamic state.

Benazir revered her father as a saint. His murder elevated him to the rank of a saint in the minds of his followers (Bhutto, 1998: 134). At the end of the day with all the perfections, her father was a human being who handled politics and did not preach religion. Her father could have been a better leader but not a saint as saints do not drink. She also reports miracles near her father's grave. "A crippled boy walks. A barren woman delivers a son" (Bhutto, 1988: 134). An Oxford literate and Harvard graduate talking of miracles is quite strange. Nature continues to astonish us since ever. Then what was the big deal if a crippled person walked and a woman bore a child and what it was to do with the death anniversary of her father? A person of 21st century speaking so and then giving a proof in writing is not appropriate. She had the exalted feelings of being an apple of her father's eyes. Her father assured her of his unlimited love for her ever since her birth. She had always been a 'jewel' for her father (Benazir, 1988: 14).

Benazir looks to be elevated directly from Greek tragedy. According to Julia Ivanyuk, Electra complex generally occurs when a girl undergoes the tragic loss of her father. This loss can

be in the form of her father's death or family separation. In Benazir's case, father did not leave the family, he was assassinated. She used to be a sort of jewel for him that was precious. Her autobiography does not show such type of comment from her father for any other family member. Circumstantially, Benazir also showed a possessive attitude not only towards her father but also towards his things when she asked the jailer about her father's ring (Bhutto, 1988: 5).

Symbolically, jewels serve as a token of love. In Shakespeare's *Twelfth Night*, Olivia suggested that the jewels are almost intended as bribes. She meant to buy Cesario's love if she could not win it. The ring also represents power and her father's voice never lost its authority (Bhutto, 1988: 90). This power was of politics which she wanted. "The scent of his cologne was still on his clothes, the scent of Shalimar. I hugged his shalwar to me [...] that night and for many others, I, too, tried to keep my father near me by sleeping with his shirt under my pillow" (Bhutto, 1988: 7). His things were a sort of replacement for her. She was habitual of her father's support and guidance. May be she was unable to face the world alone. The ongoing situation was making her feel insecure and thus causing her to seek protection in her father.

John Bowlby, suggests four important features of the "attachment bond". First "Safe Haven" that a child looks for the caregiver to protect him from harm. During the ongoing critical situation, Benazir always looked back towards her father as if he was the primary caregiver not her mother. Then "Secure Base" provides the view that, in exploring the world, a caregiver provides the child with reasonable and strong base in his learning and sorting out different things. Third comes "Proximity Maintenance" which supports the idea that a child wants to be physically close to the caregiver while discovering the world. Separation anxiety is created in a child when his caregiver is separated from him (McLeod, 2017). Due to this anxiety, she even started having recurrent dreams of losing her father. She also dreamt of him coming out of the jail alive (Bhutto, 1988: 4).

Freud relied greatly on dream interpretation as dreams are the voice of the unconscious mind. According to him, 60 to 75% of adults have recurrent dreams. These dreams highlight the unresolved conflicts in a person's mind and also provide a stage for the conflict to play out (Zadra, 1996). Through these dreams, a person's anxieties can be reduced to a lesser harmful manner. At Sihala she herself was in jail but she dreamt of her father coming out of his cell. This shows that her father's freedom was more important for her as compared to her own. Psychoanalytical critics saw the text as if it were a type of dream that contains multiple meanings. Charles Mauron in 1963 presented a whole set of principles to interpret a literary text.

According to Freud, hysterical symptoms in an individual disappeared immediately and permanently when he brought to light the memory of the event by which it was triggered and in arousing its accompanying effect (Waugh, 2006: 499). The creative practice is similar to dreaming awake. It is mimetic as well as cathartic as it shows a desire that is best presented and exposed through metaphors and symbols (Mauron, 2011). Benazir herself admits the pain associated with her painful past. She could not forget the pain of her last meeting with her father. It was not bearable for her at all. (Bhutto, 1988: 8) Writing this book had been a difficult experience for her because it felt like reliving the traumatic past (Bhutto, 1988: 3).

According to Freud, these thoughts or wishes are not forgotten rather they are buried alive and will soon come out as a disorder. Freud gave much importance to repression, as it is via repression that all the impulses, secrets, and painful memories are thrown to the unconscious. Benazir tried to divert her attention from her father by burying herself in her work. (Benazir, 1988: 36) She quotes her mother's letter describing her father's excitement to hold her. "He said you looked just like him. How thrilled he was" (Bhutto, 1988: 168). Each and every source of her father's love was memorable for her.

According to Austin Dad's approach towards life serve as an example for his daughter, even if she has an entirely different perspective of the world (as cited in McGolerick, 2017). An honourable man fights till the end of his life. (Bhutto, 1988: 103) Bhutto used to relate stories to his children in order to teach them morality and to instill the right moral ideals. Benazir also felt her responsibility to save her father's honour (Bhutto, 1988: 105). Benazir proves in her autobiography that her father was the only proper person to lead this nation. Those who opposed him were not only against him rather they were against the whole nation. Austin says, "And so, to build the great nation and foster progress, the power of such selfish reactionaries had to be curbed" (as cited in McGolerick, 2017).

Throughout her book, she uses possessive pronouns to refer to her father as "My father". She was the only one out of the four children of Bhutto who was kept in detentions, suffered humiliation, and faced obstacles bravely. She not only obsessively fought for his life but also left no stone unturned to release him from the jail. She helped people in resolving issues on behalf of her father even when she did not feel capable of doing that. So she was the one to replace him after his assassination. According to her, she transcended her gender (Bhutto, 1988: 136). Bhutto's fight was not just of Benazir's. The whole family had to uphold their father's integrity. Her brothers were not in Pakistan, as they feared to be arrested by the military. She had been through detentions for almost five years in pathetic situations, even without the basic necessities of life. So nothing special was awaiting her brothers. Even her sister Sanam remained passive all the time. Her mentioning of all this clearly speaks her point that her love was unmatched.

Hostile feelings for Mother

Freud contradicts Freud's view by saying that mother is the central figure not father. Even her mother's status was something related to her father. Her mother was the widow of the former prime minister (Bhutto, 1988: 146). She considered her father an ideal person who acts like a super hero in any complex situation. A hero who can never be replaced. On the other hand, her mother was certainly a heroine but who could be easily replaced by Benazir. According to her, her father's first marriage was a 'business marriage', in exchange of a cricket kit (Bhutto, 1988: 26).

For the favour of the father, daughters do not only stop loving the mother but also the other woman. Sexton in *All My Pretty Ones* endorsed herself in depression on the prospect of her father marrying a widow. She cried on his shoulder before he could have the second chance. Her father died after three days (Sexton, 2006: 854). The use of words like 'business marriage' indicates her hostility and scorn for her stepmother. She has a sarcastic tone when she writes that her father

agreed to this marriage for a gift of a cricket kit. Her words trigger the feelings she wants her readers to have that her status was above all others.

An Electra complex can be the outcome of an authoritative father who tries to mold his daughter into perfection. Her transferred affection toward her father might be the result of her efforts to escape her mother's engulfing attitude. Her mother belonged to the Shiite sect while the rest of the family to the Sunni sect (Bhutto, 1988: 31). She segregates her mother from the whole family just on sectarian basis. Then Benazir draws a comparison between her parents. This is a deliberative move or done unconsciously, only she can answer. Her mother was more prone to sectarian differences as she always advised Benazir to follow Shiite ceremonies whereas her father wanted to make his children and people a part of twentieth century (Bhutto, 1988: 31). An understanding can be felt when she talks about her father's views whereas a sense of restriction is found when Benazir writes about her mother's comments.

Mothers feel threatened by their daughters' expression of difference (Freud, 2011). They try to hide their feelings and pretend to be extra protective, tender and caring to hide their daughters' sexuality. On their way to Larkana, Benazir's mother draped a black cloth over her saying that she was no longer a child. Benazir saw a 'tinge of regret' on her mother's face (Bhutto, 1988: 31).

It is rather questionable on part of Benazir to feel the tinge of regret. She presents her mother as clinging to the backward ways in the upbringing of her children. It is not only the child who competes for the affection of parents but the situation could be vice versa. Parents may also fight for the attention of the child (Wallace, 2016). Her mother wanted her to wear burqa and her father did not feel any need to wear that (Bhutto, 1988: 31). What mother said, father overruled it.

She then clearly mentions burqa as a symbol of backwardness. According to her, rural women were conservative because they rarely came out without wearing burqa, and they did not drive at all (Bhutto, 1988: 136). Looking back into the past one can easily find Nusrat Bhutto as an emblem of courage and strength. She belonged to a well to do Iranian wealthy business family with an international mindset. She was a liberal woman who got connected to the Pakistan Women's National as the senior minister in 1989 and performed as an interim prime minister when Benazir delivered her second child. She actively fought for the life of her husband in the courts. Brooke Allen in "*Favoured Daughter*" explains that Nusrat did not observe purdah. She never wore burqa. This seems to be fabricated. Benazir was the upcoming Bhutto to rule. Her name meant "the one and only" then how could she be someone else? She was attentive to her mother's direction regarding prayers but her wardrobe was totally impractical for Benazir (Bhutto, 1988: 42). Clothes symbolize identity, status and gender. For Benazir the attire her mother had chosen for her was totally impractical for the life that her father planned for her. C. Freud stresses that a daughter usually replicates her mother especially if the mother is narcissistically vulnerable. (2011). It is a complicated situation where traditional and liberal styles may complicate the relations.

The whole family felt threatened by the ongoing critical situation of Bhutto's arrest. Benazir saw her mother giving money to her brothers and asking them to leave for their safety's

sake (Bhutto, 1988: 79). How can such “Mothering” ever amount to any good? Daughters have always been given a secondary position in this patriarchal society. If she was to carry on the legacy than she was to be protected if not preferably, at least equally.

The warmth with which she has written for her father is always missing in the text while she describes her mother. She casually mentions her mother wishing her birthday at the jail entrance (Bhutto, 1988: 120). Comments from her dad have a loving effect in them. “It was your great good fortune to be born on the longest day of the year, Pinkie,’ my father says when we reach him. Even the regime couldn't make the sun set early on your birthday.” (Bhutto, 1988: 120) Look how smartly she has foreshadowed her future career as a prime minister.

Benazir’s autobiography also reads as if she felt neglected by her mother. She was just eight when she was left in charge of the house. [...] She pretended to go over the accounts with her servant, Babu (Bhutto, 1988: 29). Benazir and Sanam were sent to a boarding school just because their nursemaid left them abruptly and a boarding school seemed a quick solution. She conveys confused feelings about her mother’s actions. Her father was in his death cell and her mother straight forwardly told him that his appeal was also rejected. Benazir saw her face serene when she came back home (Bhutto, 1988: 130).

Benazir could not understand what exactly her mother wanted to do. Her mother’s action was objectionable in every way. A person whose death sentence is announced cannot bear such ego satisfactions. Her mother either remained passive or added up to the complexity of the situation. Women often take their detachment as a form of punishment that might harm their mothers. Thus they try to hide their anger and turn it against themselves which takes the form of headaches or feelings of guilt.

With a satirical tone, she points out the concerns of her mother when she advised Benazir to eat fresh fruits and vegetables and drink lots of water during her detention. (Bhutto, 1988, p.168) Her father used to give her notes to deal with her detention as he remained updated despite being cut off from the outer world. However, her mother did not know that her daughter was living in so pathetic condition. Her despair can easily be felt in the passage where she talks about her sibling getting married and celebrating as if she did not exist for them (Bhutto, 1988: 172). They were settling down in their lives whereas she sacrificed her youth, beauty, and energies firstly to save her father and then his honour.

Unpreparedness for Marriage

Benazir was already struggling to assert her identity as a leader. It was difficult to surrender to a new authority again. Her father used to say, that though he did not want his daughters to get married but they had to (Bhutto, 1988: 291- 292). As fathers keep on spending more time with daughters spelling them the world around, so daughters feel more attachment towards them. Even in their teen age fathers continue this protective shell by guiding them that somehow looks like ruling over daughters. “I’ve already seen a boy I like” (Bhutto, 1988: 93). Benazir attributes it to her father for making her a mature mind politically and internationally. Since her father’s decision for her marriage was not acceptable for her and she protested not to get married. (Bhutto, 1988: 93) Her own happiness was overshadowed by her father’s plight. She could not reconcile herself

to happiness when her father was in pain (Bhutto, 1988: 291- 292). She would honor him in an ideal way. However, one thing was difficult for her to decide that how long she would continue this way. The provided options will be evaluated up to a parent. She was looking for a goal-oriented man (Bhutto, 1988: 292). Benazir's writing reveals a teenager dreaming of a prince charming to take her away. Economically stable women demand probably higher economic prospect from their husbands. Benazir also wanted someone to match her high-profile status. Her status was not based only on monetary value. She was young and suffered so much tragedy in her life. Her friends told her that people revered her as a saint (Bhutto, 1988: 293). There have been many people who have spent time in jail without any reason but they do not rise up to the status of saints.

Here, she has started grounding for the change of her mind. Her stance to remain single started to change. Now, this unmarried status was a symbol of boredom for her and she was the new (Bhutto, 1988: 137). She thought that her single status was a suspect to others and journalists often asked her the reason behind delay in marriage. (Bhutto, 1988: 293) Certainly, a society pressure clouded her. The idea to have her own children had become more appealing to her (Bhutto, 1988: 295). Under the veil of religion and society are luring her own wills.

Females are usually self-centered. They love to be loved. According to Freud, narcissistic women are attractive for men not only because of their beauty but also because of their personal characteristics (Theory Ego & Narcissism, 2010). Zardari also got impressed by her personality and wanted to marry her. (Bhutto, 1988: 294) Narcissistic people are easily recognizable as they are selfish. They only acknowledge their own interests. Their conversation usually revolves around their own ego, which can also be called 'business deals' (Types of Psychological Complexes 2011).

Psychoanalytically this narcissism can be satisfied with a partner who is quiet, dependent, calm and submissive. Yet there remains a dependency factor consciously or unconsciously. Their ego matters should not be hurt. Startlingly they show no interest in men as no one worth their love. Fathers snatch their full focus. This type of feeling can dwell into a relationship that is unhappy. This search continues unless an object of Electra fixation is not found.

Benazir seems complaining against her aunt for promoting 'insipid types' for her claiming that they prove to be better husbands. Benazir was sure that she would be unhappy with such type of person (Bhutto, 1988: 293). May be she herself felt that she missed a good opportunity by saying 'No' to her father. She has voiced her reservations for Zardari. All she could remember about their first meeting was the argument between them (Bhutto, 1988: 293). Her mentioning of conjecture clearly points that she could not respect him at that time. Although she was trying to reconcile herself to the thought of marriage, still she tried to avoid it because she was not ready (Bhutto, 1988: 296). Sentimental troubles of girls in deciding for their marriage show their unpreparedness. And when finally they decide, their conditions for love, care, and attention come as a hurdle that makes them insensitive and they become unable to respect their partner. Her life did not revolve around her husband and she did not want to live with her in-laws. Her private time was dedicated for her friends (Bhutto, 1988: 296).

It is really difficult to understand what exactly her purpose is behind writing this. She was the president of the Oxford debating society. She had full command of language. She knew the stylistic devices and their effects on readers. Her uneasiness shows that her desired choice was not available to her and Zardari was not at all an option.

Only so called compatibility that she found was the similarity of the sufferings of both families under the Martial Law regime. (Bhutto, 1988: 298) Confessional writers reveal their private matters, mental anguish, and other impulses. (Abrams as cited in Zayyani 32) Benazir clearly mentions her decision not to go for her honeymoon because she could not take off from her work. Her husband's desire to have a big family was also postponed because they both needed time to accept each other (Bhutto, 1988: 299, 303). Benazir was not ready to start her married life. She considered her arranged marriage a price she had to pay for her political career (Bhutto, 1988: 292). The reader can easily grasp the latent meaning. Probably women feel happy if they deliver a son. A mother can achieve unlimited satisfaction through her relation with the son. For her, this is the perfect of all relationships. She can live her dreams and desires through her son. (Irigaray, 107)

Most couples follow the same prototype of family relationships they witnessed in their childhood. Events like birth of a child can cause behavioral patterns to recur. The name Bilawal means the same as Benazir, without comparison. "So here was a name that touched the mother, the father, and the culture and history of the land" (Bhutto, 1988: 321). There is a similarity drawn between Bhutto, Benazir and Bilawal. They all are revered as saints in *Daughter of the East* for one reason or the other. Finally, she was happy as she found a glimpse of her father in Zardari. Her son would grow up with fatherly affection just like her (Bhutto, 1988: 320).

Competition with Siblings

An Electra complex always wants to have a special place in her father's life. (Auplish) In our society girls are predisposed to the idea to compete for male attention. In Disney movies, a princess struggles to get the prince from another female character or Cinderella struggles to go to the ball and get the prince by fighting her stepmother and stepsisters. Benazir idolized her father caring for her mummy, enjoying with her making trips. This all got stored in her unconscious mind. As a little girl, she might envy that care of her father. Her father was also responsible for this. Preferring daughter to wife confused his daughter's thoughts. She considered herself the most important person for her father. She unconsciously started to compete with her mother and siblings. She states that as the firstborn she enjoyed the special and sometimes lonely place in the family. She was the closest to her father (Bhutto, 1988: 29). She had the largest share of her father's love. Even during his solitary confinement, her education was his primary concern (Bhutto, 1988: 37).

She was determined to stay in Pakistan and help her father (Bhutto, 1988: 98). Even if given a choice, she did not leave her father like her brothers and sister.

Benazir has drawn an exception for her even in giving birth to a baby boy. Her child was the first Bhutto grandchild born in Pakistan. Her father had just three granddaughters till then. (Bhutto, 1988: 319) She gave birth to the most celebrated child to carry on the legacy. The whole country celebrated his birth by sending flowers and cakes (Bhutto, 1988: 320).

Conclusion

“The author almost admits that the title of the book is a misnomer and not a true autobiography when she claims it to be the record of General Zia-ul-Haq’s Martial Law regime” (Pound, 2006). By analyzing Benazir Bhutto’s discourse about her life, the researcher has come to the conclusion that her autobiography did not do a successful job of explaining who Benazir was rather it focuses more on elaborating who her father was. Through writing, she rebuilt her father’s image to the modern society and also achieved catharsis. There had been too many episodes discussing her father as if her life was just an episode of his life. She had an obsession with the feelings of hatred for General Zia-ul-Haq. Her autobiography proved that her father groomed her as the leader of the new generations. Benazir was an ambitious woman who appreciated her father’s ideologies. Her relation with her mother, as indexed throughout the text, is clearly granted a secondary status as compared to that with her father. With regard to her choice of a husband, apparently she went against the typical behaviour of women driven by Electra complex in favouring a person who was not a substitute for her father in any way. She gave a great emphasis that there was no romantic approach as it was as so many usual marriages to settle and conceive a family to continue their lineage. However, her choice could be rationalized because he granted her the greatest amount of freedom to be herself. Her father and his legacy were the chief concerns of her life and she excelled her siblings in that.

References

- Allen, B. 2015. *Electra Complex: Are You A Daddy’s Girl?* Retrieved July 11, 2017 from <http://theviewspaper.net/electra-complex-are-you-a-daddys-girl/>
- Allen, B. 2016. *Benazir Bhutto: Favored Daughter*. Boston: New Harvest Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.
- Bhattacharjee, J. 2012, June 19. *Fatima Bhutto: The iron Lady*. Retrieved July 11, 2017 from <https://shopnobaz.com/2012/06/fatima-bhutto-the-iron-lady/>
- Bhutto, B. 1988. *Daughter of the East*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Bhutto, B. 1988. *Daughter of destiny: An autobiography*. New York: Simon and Schuster.
- Bhutto, B. 2008. *Daughter of the East: An autobiography*. New York: Simon and Schuster.
- Bianca. (n.d.). Benazir Bhutto. Retrieved January 2, 2017 from <http://atlantisonline.smfforfree2.com/index.php/topic,5817.0.html?PHPSESSID=8c3c7b7630b54b0137b1e4530eadaa69>
- Borovečki-Jakovljević, S. I., and Matačić, S. 2005. The Oedipus Complex in the Contemporary Psychoanalysis. *Collegium antropologicum*, 29 (1): 351-360.
- Buruma, I. 1989. *The Double Life of Benazir Bhutto*. Retrieved March 2, 1989 from <http://www.nybooks.com/articles/1989/03/02/the-double-life-of-benazir-bhutto/>
- Cherry, K. 2006. *What Is the Electra Complex in Psychoanalytic Theory?* Retrieved January 12, 2006 from <https://www.verywell.com/what-is-the-electra-complex-2795170>

- Offerman-Zuckerberg, J. (Ed.). 2013. *Gender in transition: a new frontier*. New York & London: Springer Science & Business Media.
- Editorial. 2014, December 27. Missing Benazir. Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1153320>
- Engle, G. 2016, August 29. The Electra Complex: Are We All Just Dating Our Dads? Retrieved August 29, 2016 from <https://www.thrillist.com/sex-dating/nation/electra-complex-dating-daddy-issues-how-to-fix-them>.
- Fatima, K. 2015. *Trauma Theory and Electra Complex: the Case of the Two Main Characters in Vladimir Nabokov's Lolita* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Kasdi Merbah University, Ouargla, Algeria.
- Fatima, S. 2013. The Influence of Psychoanalysis Theory on Eugene O' Neil. *The Indian Review of World Literature* 9 (2): 1 -6.
- Freud, H. C. 2010. *Electra vs Oedipus: The Drama of the Mother–Daughter Relationship*. London & New York: Routledge.
- Freud, S. and Brill, A. A. 2001. Three contributions to the theory of sex. Massachusetts: Courier Corporation.
- Freud, S. 1971. An outline of psychoanalysis (1940). Part I. The mind and its workings. Chapter I: The psychical apparatus. *PsycEXTRA Dataset*. doi:10.1037/e417472005-623
- Freud, S. 1975. *An Outline of Psychoanalysis*. New York: The Hogarth Press.
- Freud's Psychosexual Stage Theory [Web log post]. Retrieved August 14, 2017 from http://changingminds.org/explanations/learning/freud_stage.htm
- Gassma, I. J. 2014. Ballots and Bullets: The Right to Democratic Governance in International
- Gupta, R. 2004. *State in India, Pakistan, Russia and Central Asia*. Dehli: Kalpaz Publications, Law After the Egyptian Coup. 621.
- Hosein, F. 2017, Mar 4. Daughter and Father Complex Issues. Retrieved from <https://www.selfgrowth.com/articles/daughter-and-father-complex-issues>
- Hunt, O. 2017, July 23. Sylvia Plath Poetry on Father-Daughter Relationships. Retrieved August 2, 2017 from http://www.streetdirectory.com/travel_guide/103422/poetry/sylvia_plath_poetry_on_father_daughter_relationships.html
- Huchon, L. 2006. *Formalism and the Freudian Aesthetic: The Example of Charles Mauron*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Imtiaz, S. 2011, October 24. Nusrat Bhutto: The woman, wife and mother. *The Express Tribune* [Pakistan]. Retrieved January 2, 2017 from <https://tribune.com.pk/story/280714/nusrat-bhutto-the-woman-wife-and-mother/>
- Irigaray, L. 1985. *Speculum of the Other Woman*. Cornell University Press.
- Javid, H. 2017. Non-fiction: her father's daughter. Retrieved June 18, 2017 from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1340139>
- Jemmer, P. 2006. Abreaction - Catharsis: Stirring Dull Roots with Spring Rain. *European Journal of Clinical Hypnosis* 7 (1): 26-36.

- Jung, C. G. 1915. The theory of psychoanalysis. *Journal of nervous and mental disease publishing Company* 19 (1): 1- 137.
- Klein, M. 2017. The origins of transference. In *The Analytic Situation* 13-22. New York: Routledge.
- Kamal, H. and Khan, M. 2015. Girls' First Love; Their Fathers: Freudian Theory Electra Complex. *Research Journal of Language, Literature and Humanities* 2 (4): 1-4.
- Marković, Z. 2000. Psychoanalytic conceptions of marriage and marital relationships. *FACTA Universitatis-Philosophy, Sociology, Psychology and History* 7(1): 379-389.
- Mattoon, M. A. 2005. Jung and the human psyche: An understandable introduction. New York: Taylor and Francis.
- McLeod, S. 2017. Psychosexual stages. *Simply psychology*. Retrieved July 11, 2017 from <http://www.simplypsychology.org/psychosexual.html>. 20Jul.2017
- McDougall, M. E. 2018. Teaching Native American and Middle East American Literature in the Secondary School Classroom (Doctoral dissertation, Bowling Green State University).
- Nickerson, B. 2012. *Rebellious Performances: An Examination of the Gender Roles of Clytemnestra and Electra* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation. University of Colorado, Colorado).
- Offerman-Zuckerberg, J. 2013. *Gender in transition: a new frontier*. New York: Springer Science & Business Media.
- O'Neill, E. 2012. *Mourning Becomes Electra*. Random House.
- Plath, S. 2003. Daddy. In *The Anthology of Contemporary American Poetry*, edited by Helen Vendler, I.B. Tauris, 306-309.
- Pound, G. 2008. Daughter of the East by Benazir Bhutto. Retrieved March 17 2008 from <http://reviewingbooksandmovies.blogspot.com/2008/03/daughter-of-east-by-benazir-bhutto.html>.
- Reader-response theory - Oxford Reference. 2017. Retrieved January 2, 2017 from <http://www.oxfordreference.com/view/10.1093/oi/authority.20110803100406762>
- Reid, R. 2009. Daughter of Destiny by Benazir Bhutto. Retrieved March 7, 2009 from <http://reviews.rebeccareid.com/daughter-of-destiny-by-benazir-bhutto/>
- Scott, J. 2005. *Electra after Freud: Myth and culture*. Cornell University Press.
- Sexton, A. 2006. All My Pretty Ones. *The Oxford Book of American Poetry*, edited by David Lehman, Oxford University Press, 853-854.
- Solangi, M. 2017. Remembering Benazir Bhutto. *The Indian Review of World Literature in English* 13(1): 29-33.
- Shaffer, D. R. 2004. *Social and Personality Development* (ed). Wadsworth: Wadsworth Publishing.
- Shoaib, M. 2014. Electra Complex in Shakespeare's Twelfth Night. *Lapis Lazuli-An. International Literary Journal (LILJ)* 4 (1): 1-8.
- Smith, D. L. 1999. Sigmund Freud's Programme for a Science of Consciousness. *British Journal of Psychotherapy* 15 (4): 412-424.

- Smith, D. L. 2013. *Freud's Philosophy of the Unconscious*. Bostn & London: Kluwer Academic Publisher.
- Sofe, A. 2012. Sigmund Freud's psychoanalytic theory Oedipus complex: A critical study with reference to D. H. Lawrence's "Sons and Lovers". *International Journal of English and Literature* 3 (3): doi:10.5897/ijel11.137
- Sophocles 2007. Oedipus Rex. Kitab Mehal.
- Southwick, S. 2002. *The Freud encyclopedia: Theory, therapy, and culture*. New York: Routledge.
- Thornton, and Stephen P. 1856-1939. Sigmund Freud. Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy.
- Thornton, S. P. 2017. Sigmund Freud (1856-1939). Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy Retrieved January 2, 2017 from <http://www.iep.utm.edu/freud/>.
- Vaughan, A. T. and Vaughan, V. M. 1993. *Shakespeare's Caliban: a cultural history*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Vendler, H. (Ed.). 2003. *The Anthology of Contemporary American Poetry*. London: Palgrave.
- Versey, F. 2007. The Complex Electra. Retrieved December 28, 2007 from Counter Punch: <https://www.counterpunch.org/2007/12/28/the-complex-electra/>
- Versey, F. Benazir and Indira Gandhi. Retrieved December 13, 2007 from Arab News: <http://www.arabnews.com/node/307210>
- Waugh, P. (Ed.). 2006. *Literary theory and criticism: An Oxford guide*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Willner, D. 1982. The Oedipus Complex, Antigone, and Electra: The Woman as Hero and Victim. *American Anthropologist* 84 (1): 58-78.
- Types of Psychological Complexes. Wordpress, <https://analyticalpsychology.wordpress.com/tag/elektra/> . Accessed 10 Aug 2017.
- Waugh, P. 2006 Literary Theory and Criticism: An Oxford Guide. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Weaver, M. A. 1993. Bhutto's Fateful Moment. Retrieved 9 26, 1993 from The New Yorker: <http://www.newyorker.com/magazine/1993/10/04/bhuttos-fateful-moment>. 23 Jul. 2017
- Willner, D. 1982. The Oedipus complex, Antigone, and Electra: The Woman as Hero and Victim. *American Anthropologist* 84 (1): 58-78.
- Wilson, S. 2009. Sigmund Freud and the oedipal complex. How to Understand People. *Guardian News and Media* 7 (1).
- Zayyani, M. 2017. Haunting Memories Exorcised: Electra Complex in Sylvia Plath's Daddy. *The Indian Review of World Literature* 13 (1): 29-33.
- Zulqernain, T. 2015. After Benazir. Retrieved on December 27, 2015 from: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1228662>.