Global Citizenship Education: Values to be taught in the Light of the Rising Identity Crisis

Iram Rubab
Anusheh Bakht Aziz
Ahmed Usman
Aaisha Amjad

In the 21st century, the world has become a global village that is more interdependent and interconnected than ever. Economic, political and security situation of one country has an undeniable impact on other countries. This increased interdependence and interaction between people from diverse cultural backgrounds and a diffusion of ideas has given rise to an identity crisis. Questions like, 'does progress in globalization and promotion of global citizenship mean that we are forging a unified national identity?' lead to 'sovereignty conflicts' in the minds of young adults who have a desire to maintain their local identity. This article examines the problematic with reference to Pakistan and its state's quest to achieve a homogeneous national identity that is 'localized' and 'inward' looking. It looks at how globalization is causing an identity crisis and how global citizenship education can lay foundations of an awareness, which embodies skills helpful in preparing young people as responsible global citizens while respecting their communal, cultural, and national identities. This can be done by promoting education that not only creates simple awareness or tolerance, but inculcates analytical and critical thinking to ensure a deeper understanding of the world issues and an ability to take decisive actions as active citizens.

Introduction

The most significant feature of the 21st century is the broad economic, social, cultural and political revolution, often called globalization[1]of the world or its conversion into a "global village"[2]or a "network society"[3]. This massive change has resulted in the emergence of a 'shrinking world' where due to 'time-space compression'[4], there has been an increased interaction between different cultures whose influence is not only confined to the economic domain, but has also affected the social and cultural scenario. It can be rightly said that changes in the socio-political situation of the world are the imminent consequence of economic

globalization because the two phenomena's are closely interwoven[5]. However, globalization is a very complicated and a multifaceted process[6]. On one hand, globalization promotes 'homogeneity, synchronization, integration, unity and universalism' but on the other hand, it hampers 'localization, heterogeneity, differentiation, diversity and particularism'. These two consequences of globalization are inevitable processes. Hence, the effects of globalization can be manifested in the form of struggles pertaining to identity and social-political scenes of today's world[7].

As Castells (1996) states, our world and our lives are being shaped by conflicting trends of globalization and identity because the two are consistent on many levels and hence 'coexist'[8]. This is because although globalization has become a major resource for human capital development and information technology, this greater influx of knowledge and penetration of different cultures is having deteriorating effects on social and cultural environment where identity is concerned[9]. While identity can be simply defined as a way, if not universal, of socially modifying cultural experiences[10], on this matter British cultural scientist Hall is of the point of view that identity can be defined as recognition of familiar features and can include, but is not confined, to ethnic, linguistic, religious, historical, territorial, cultural and political attributes with a certain group[11]. His idea coincides with the concept of 'sameness, belonging and unity', which are expressed by a known psychologist Erikson, whose definition of identity encompasses the concept of sameness and continuity of the self across time and space. However, Hall states that although identity is associated with a shared 'true self' of people with common historical or cultural backgrounds, it is also a never completed process and is 'logged in contingency'. Hence, Hall's concept of identity enables people to ask and answer questions like, "What we are?" and "What have we become" and so is based on the framework of "fluid and contingent"[12]. Hence, identity gives meaning to the lives of people by answering these vital questions.

At this juncture, it is important to recognize-as stated before-that culture changes, if not dramatically, when it is brought in contact with other cultures and societies, which is what globalization symbolizes[13]. At the same time, culture's effect on development of identity cannot be denied as stated by Tomlinson (1999), 'people make culture and culture makes people in the form of cultural identity'[14]. This means that any alteration in culture will definitely influence the process by which people derive their identity. It also means that through education we can create awareness among people that can supplement the process of identity construction. This article explores in detail how and what type of identity crisis is caused by globalization and expounds on how global citizenship education can assist young people in their struggle for a coherent identity.

Globalization and Identity

It has been established earlier that globalization has an effect on the identity of people, as Eriksen (2018) suggests that identity is basically a sense of sameness and belonging which helps a person identify themselves with a certain group of

people. He further says that it is normal for children in their teenage to be unclear about their identity, as they themselves are being introduced to several different ideas of being. However, if this lack of clarity appears in adults, it is surely a cause of concern[15]. At the same time, globalization has completely altered the process of identity construction; people now develop a sense of self from global media rather than solely from values and family[16]. This new process of identity construction is considered a threat by conservative members of society, who feel that it is affecting their cultural values. Hence, globalization and increased influx of media are considered a threat to the local cultures because globalization talks about uniformity and homogeneity, which inevitably means suppression of diverse cultures due to spread of one.

The World Values survey shows that people around the globe have different ways of identifying themselves. According to the figures, 13% consider themselves to be primarily citizens of the world or global citizens, 38% identify themselves with their nation-states and the remaining 49% prioritize their regional or local identity above any other[17]. These figures assert that the spread of a homogeneous culture and therefore, an identity will surely be considered a threat to their local or national identity by a majority of the people. The perceived threat exists in spite of the assertion by some scholars that globalization is not a real threat to cultural identity because identity is not a 'fragile attachment', but rather an 'institutionalized' way of organizing and leading society and social life[18].
On the contrary, it cannot be denied that globalization has increased the gap in identity formation because nation-state is no longer giving meaning to the life of people, so people tend to prioritize local identities over national ones[19]. However, education and specifically global citizenship education can be used as a tool to give meaning to the life of people and thereby, help them build an identity.

Identity and Pakistan
As illustrated by Jalal's work, the collective imagining of Pakistani nationhood is contingent on an exclusionary narrative of 'us' and 'them'. This identity building relies heavily on ideological indoctrination through false historical facts that are taught to students from their nascent years at school and hence, are quite effective in breeding bigotry[20]. Thus, a Pakistani identity makes for an extremely 'local' outlook on life at the behest of a state that thrives on politics of hate. Moreover, the state's focus on carving out a homogenous national identity has led to alienation of various provincial and other local forms of identification. The aftermath of such state propaganda as well preferential treatment of certain traits to be more Pakistani than others has not only caused individual grievances, but also led to other grave consequences. It is perhaps one of the causes of extremism and terrorism that confront our country and has embroiled our youth in an identity crisis. In such a scenario, global citizenship education,that offers a complete overhaul of the current education system,is more relevant than ever. Its various

facets that aim to inculcate tolerance and other important skills in youth are discussed below.

Role of Education

Globalization like other spheres of life has also influenced the type of education which needs to be imparted in schools and has been -if not directly then indirectly due to increased inter-cultural engagements and accelerated mobility of people- propagating reform in this field[21]. Education is the foundation which enables people to build their life because it not only gives them awareness, but also the ability to make informed decisions. At the same time, it increases the scope of opportunity in their lives that in turn enhances the whole life experience[22]. This means that a proper education and global citizenship education can assist the youth of today with the struggles for identity.

Due to increasing diffusion of cultures and ideas, it is now critical that students understand the "complex web of cultural, material, local and global processes" in detail and if education fails to achieve this objective, it might promote a 'civilizing mission'[23]. It is essential nowadays to promote a culture of global education because globalization is increasingly becoming a part of our lives.New generations need the necessary skills and abilities to lead a successful life, one in which they are more tolerant and ready to work towards the global good. This world has to accept that globalization is now a reality and we need to develop competencies that prepare us to live as productive global citizens. As Bauman states:

> If you are not 'global', the walls built of immigration controls, of residence lawsand of 'clean streets' and 'zero tolerance' grow taller to try to contain the diffusion of ideas, goods, information and peoples in order to protect specific local spaces from unwanted 'contamination'. Thus, we end up with a one way transfusion (in its legal form at least) rather than a diffusion.[24]

It is also essential that the education imparted at schools is able to prepare children for the changing ideas of citizenship in this highly globalised world, where there is an extensive diffusion of ideas and cultures[25]. This article explores and identifies the basic competencies that global citizenship education should develop. These competences should be part of global citizenship education and teaching pedagogies in line withthe dynamic socio-cultural needs of today's world, especially the identity crisis confronting ouryoung minds.

What should Global Citizenship Education (GCE) Entail?

A vast chunk of scholarly work on global citizenship education advocates that while Global Citizenship Education prepares youth to participate in the multi-cultural world productively, it should also understand the delicate relationship of global unity in order to maintain and appreciate diversity.The following themes have emerged after extensive literature review.

Ability to understand that 'we' includes global others

One of the key elements of the global citizenship education is to identify oneself as a citizen of the global world and not as some "fraction of the whole"[26]. It further means that we must be aware of the problems and issues of people around the world and are ready to cater to them as we do in our own country or community. In other words, global citizenship should translate into a sense of ownership which is not confined by boundaries, but rather extends to each person and each culture on this planet.

This concept has been articulated very effectively by Kilick, who states that: *"Global citizenship is only a geographic extension of current and historical construct of citizenship-or, better perceived as good personhood"*[27].Understanding of this concept will not only foster an ownership and acceptance of the problems of this world, but will also prevent young individuals from believing that global citizenship is an infringement of their national or local identity.

Critical awareness of one's own culture and appreciation for other cultures

GCE should clarify that ability to identify oneself with the global community does not mean that one has to surrender one's cultural, local or national identity because these identities enrich one's life today. However, the key purpose of global citizenship education is to have mutual respect for other cultures[28]. As UNESCO's Director General stated: "Recognition of inherent dignity and of equal and inalienable rights of all members of human family is the foundation of freedom, justice and peace in the world"[29]. Along with respect for all individuals of the planet, GCE should develop an appreciation for all cultures and importance of diversity in students[30]. Here, James A. Banks makes a very important point. According to him, without a deep understanding of one's own culture and origin one cannot appreciate or respect someone else's culture. Hence, both a deeper understanding and in other words a critical awareness of one's culture combined with the understanding that in the contemporary globalised age, culture and traditions of one society has an effect on other cultures should be the goal of GCE[31]. This cultural awareness will help students in identifying the most meaningful thing in their life and will supplement the process of identification. At the same time, it will enable the youth to work together to solve the world's problems more effectively.

Critical learning skills

To make this learning more effective and authentic, GCE should enable students to identify that there are many creators of knowledge and recognize that the knowledge we receive has diverse cultural backgrounds. It is therefore important to understand that our assumptions and opinions are often influenced by the context in which they are given[32]. Hence, the need to have critical literacy becomes a central theme to GCE. Learners should develop skills such as reflection; an ability to critically examine the issues and the likely solutions of the problems faced by people globally[33]. As argued by Banks,"Literate citizens in a diverse democratic

society should be reflective, moral and active citizens in an inter-connected world."[34].

Urge to make the world more sustainable and promotion of a pro-active culture

It is not enough to have an understanding and ownership of world's problems until we are efficiently preparing for the future too, one which is based on the principles of sustainability[35]. In other words, GCE should develop effective links between past, present and future. Learners should be engaged in activities where they are taught to imagine future and so foresee the problems and steps for sustainable development. This activity, according to Kniep (1986), can also be called 'inventing the future backwards"[36]. Along with it, learners should be taught not only the ability to critique problems of the past, but also to devise possible solutions to these problems[37]. On this point, Gadotti's observation about today's education is quite apt:"…education as we see it today is more a part of sustainable development's problem rather than a part of its solutions because it reinforces the principles and values of unsustainable life and economy..."[38].Learning to explore the problem and coming up with its solution goes hand in hand; without exploring the problems, we cannot solve them, and without an aim to solve the issues, we cannot achieve a more sustainable world. Therefore, GCE should foster a culture of exploring problems with an aim to solve them.

Learning to live with justice

One of the major responsibilities of GCE is to emphasize that finding solutions to the world's problems, such as environmental issues, poverty and inflation is not our 'moral' duty, but an 'obligation of justice'. This is because being a citizenship entails an obligation to ensure justice and justice means that every individual as a citizen of this world receives an equal opportunity to live. Hence,the obligation of justice rather than pity or sympathy should be the motivation behind the urge to do good for the global community. Dobson states that,"Being human raises moral issues while being a citizen raises political issues"[39]. There is a fine line between the two concepts. At present, moral duty propagates nations/people to help others and this fosters a sense of superiority amongst the helping parties and as a consequence gives them power over others leading to an unjust society. Hence, GCE should promote an understanding that solving the world's issues is not our moral obligation as human beings, but our common political responsibility as a global citizen to foster a more just and peaceful society.

Human rights teachings

Human rights teachings should be the underpinning of a GCE education. The rights and responsibilities of each individual should be based on the teachings of universal human rights. This is because major conflicts in the world start from basic human rights violations[40]. It is critical that GCE should foster human rights awareness to ensure a just world.

Conclusion

While the process of globalization has benefited this modernworld in various ways, it has also presented a variety of challenges. One of the challenges of 21st century is the loss of a coherent sense of identity or belonging to one country or region, especially when people are connected and ultimately influencedby cultures of other societies and can identify with them. However, a sensitive global citizenship education can bridge this gap and enable learners to deliberate on their identity in a critical manner and effectively understand it while respecting other cultures and societies. At the same time, the responsibility of Global Citizenship Education is bigger than simply creating awareness and understanding. It has to influence behavioral change that stems from a learner's critical engagement and an ability to differentiate between the nuances present in today's world. This will lead learners to be empathetic, politically just, and culturally aware. Without doubt, providing such a holistic education is a hefty task, but with emphasis on cognitive learning, these values and behaviors can be nurtured. Global Citizenship Education now forms the core theme of Sustainable Development Goals and hopefully this will have a positive impact in the years to come. With reference to Pakistan, it is hoped that global citizenship education will make our classrooms more tolerant and critical so that our youth can deal with its pressing questions about identity in a manner that is of utility to the world.

Notes and References

_____

[1]Majid Tehranian, Global Communications and World Politics: Domination, Development and Discourse 1999, Boulder: Lynne Riener

[2]Marshall McLuhan, Understanding Media, Film Quarterly 1966 No. 3 p.58–64

[3]Babak Bahador, "Book Review: Manuel Castells. End of Millennium, Vol. 3 of The Information Age: Economy, Society, and Culture (Oxford: Blackwell, 1998, 418)." Millennium: Journal of International Studies 1999 Vol.28 No.1 p.166–67

[4]David Harvey, The Condition of Postmodernity: An enquiry into the Origins of Cultural Change, Oxford: Blackwell Publishing (1989); Garth le Pere, Kato Lambrechts, "Globalisation and National Identity Construction: Nation building in South Africa", in *Identity? Theory, Polictics, History.*Pretoria: Human Sciences Research Council 1999 p.11-38

[5]Malcolm Waters, Globalization, London: Routledge, 1995 p.140.

[6]Naz Arab, Waseem Khan, Umar Daraz, and Mohammad Hussain."The Crises of Identity: Globalization and Its Impacts on Socio-Cultural and Psychological Identity among Pakhtuns of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan." International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences 2012 Vol.1 No.1

[7]ElireaBornman,Struggles of Identity in the Age of Globalisation, Communicatio 2003 Vol.29 No. 1-2 p. 24–47

[8]Peter Hall, The Rise of the Network Society (The Information Age: Economy, Society and Culture, Volume 1), Manuel Castells, Blackwell Oxford 1996, Justice, Nature & the Geography of Distance, David Harvey, Blackwell Oxford 1996. *Cities* 15 No. 2 p. 132–34

[9]Ibid

[10]Christine Morley, Critical Reflection as a Response to Globalization, International Journal of Social Welfare 2004 Vol.13 No.2

[11]Stuart Hall, Introduction: Who needs Identity? in*Questions of Cultural Identity,* London: Sage Publications 1996

[12]Mustafa KOC, Cultural Identity Crisis in the Age of Globalization and Technology, The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology 2006 Vol. 5 Issue 1 article 5

[13]Zygmunt Bauman, From Pilgrim to Tourist-or a Short History of Identity, in *Questions of Cultural Identity,* London: Sage Publications 1996 p.1-17.

[14]John Tomlinson, Globalization and Culture, Rugman Reviews 2009 p.135-136

[15]Thomas HyllandEriksen, Re-embedding Identity Politics as a Response to Globalization, Sociology of Globalization 2018 p.99-106

[16]Jens Bartelson, Jan AartScholte, "Globalization: A Critical Introduction", Contemporary Sociology 2002 Vol.31 No.5

[17]Manuel Castells, Globalization and Identity, Transfer: Journal of Contemporary Culture 2006 p.56-66, retrieved on 25th October, 2019 from: http://llull.cat/IMAGES_175/transfer01-foc01.pdf

[18]David Howes, Cross-Cultural Consumption: Global Markets, Local Realities, New York: Routledge1996

[19]Ibid

[20]Ayesha Jalal, Conjuring Pakistan: History as Official Imagining, International Journal of Middle East Studies 1995 Vol.27 No.1 p.73-89

[21]Andrew Jakubowicz, Cultural Diversity, Cosmopolitan Citizenship and Education: Issues, Options and Implications for Australia, Southbank, Vic.: Australian Education Union 2009

[22]Alan Sears, Andrew Hughes, "Citizenship: Education or Indoctrination?", Citizenship and Teacher Education 2006 Vol. 2 Issue1 p.3-17

[23]Vanessa De Oliveira Andreotti, Soft versus Critical Global Citizenship Education, Development Education in Policy and Practice 2014 p.21-31

[24]Zygmunt Bauman, Globalization: The Human Consequences, New York City: Columbia University Press 1998

[25]Ian Davies, Mark Evans, Alan Reid, "Global Citizenship Education? A Critique of 'Global Education' and 'Citizenship Education'", British Journal of Educational Studies 2005 Vol.53 No.1 p.66-89

[26]Martha Nussbaum, Education for Citizenship in an Era of Global Connection, Studies in Philosophy and Education 2002 Vol.21 p.289-303

[27]David Kilick, Students as Global Citizens: Being and Becoming through the Lived-Experience of International Mobility, Leeds Metropolitan University 2011

[28]ibid, p. 289

[29]United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, Enhancing Global Sustainability, Johannesburg, South Africa: World Summit on Sustainable Development 2002. Retrieved on 12th October, 2014 from: http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.php-URL_ID=7980&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

[30]ibid

[31]James A. Banks, Teaching for Social Justice, Diversity, and Citizenship in a Global World, The Educational Forum 2004 Vol.68 No.4 p.296-305

[32]James A. Banks, Multicultural Education, Transformative Knowledge, and Action: Historical and Contemporary Perspectives, New York: Teachers College Press 1996

[33]James A. Banks, Diversity, Group Identity, and Citizenship Education in a Global Age, Educational Research 2008 Vol.37 No.3 p.129-139

[34]Ibid

[35]Martin Haigh, Internationalization, Global Citizen and Graduate Attributes (A 30 Minute Guide) 2008, accessed on 25th October, 2019 from: http://efsandquality.glos.ac.uk/toolkit/Brookes_GC_Guide.pdf

[36]Willard M. Kniep, Defining a Global Education by its Content, Social Education 1986 Vol. 50 No. 6 p. 437-446

[37]Paulo Freire, Pedagogy of the Oppressed, Ed., translator M. B. Ramos, New York: Continuum 1997

[38]Moacir Gadotti, What We Need to Learn to Save the Palnet, Journal of Education for Sustainable Development 2008 Vol.2 No.1 p.21-30

[39]Andrew Dobson, Globalization, Cosmopolitanism and the Environment, International Relations 2005 Vol.19 No.3 p.259-273

[40]United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, UNESCO for Human Rights Education 1997, Paris: UNESCO