

## **Transforming Perspective Teachers' Beliefs about Teaching: What Teacher Educators do in a Teacher Education Institution in Pakistan?**

\* Haji Karim Khan (Corresponding Author)

\*\* Yasmeen Batool

\*\*\* Farah Deebs

### **Abstract**

*Taking the lenses of cultural perspectives, this study has investigated the role of teacher educators in transforming the teaching and learning beliefs of prospective teachers in a formal teacher education program in a remote mountainous region of Pakistan. We used a qualitative exploratory approach to conduct the study and collected data from eight teacher educators through semi-structured interviews, non-participatory observations of the classroom practices, as well as researchers' field notes. Findings showed that the changing culture of teacher education in Pakistan seem to redefine and reinterpret teacher educators' roles in transforming prospective teachers' beliefs. As a result, teacher educators saw themselves as role models, counselors, mentors, storytellers, and listeners. These findings have pertinent implications for the teacher educators' roles in similar settings.*

**Keywords:** Teacher Educators, Transforming Beliefs, Teacher Education, Prospective Teachers

### **Introduction**

Studies have shown that prospective teachers' learning becomes more constructive during their professional development programs and early teaching career (Brownlee, 2003). They join the pre-service teacher education programs with a certain repertoire of beliefs about teaching and learning. Those beliefs are nested in their background as students in the schools and colleges. In the pre-service teacher education program, the interaction with the teacher educators provides them with opportunities to question, rethink, reconstruct, reconceptualize, and transform their pre-existing notions, and teaching and learning beliefs. Consequently, teacher educators' key role is to teach them by refining their skills, fortifying their knowledge of content, and transforming their ontological and epistemological beliefs to make them effective teachers. As a result, contemporary research on teacher education focuses more on transforming teachers' beliefs as it has a greater impact on their classroom practices. It is therefore imperative to investigate teachers' beliefs and their practices (Goncalves, Azevedo, & Alves, 2013). In other words, without modifying the teaching belief of prospective teachers, ensuring the quality of teaching in the classrooms will always remain a dream unfulfilled. In this regard, the culture and milieu of the teacher education institution play an important role in shaping up the beliefs of prospective teachers about teaching and learning. Given the scarcity of literature on teacher education institution, literature from school culture (Cooper, 1988; Deal & Peterson, 2009) provide basic lenses to the study.

This study has explored the perceptions of teacher educators about their roles in constructing prospective teachers' beliefs, why they do so or what makes them do so, and how they perform such roles in a remote context in the northern mountainous region of Pakistan.

### **Theoretical perspectives and review of literature**

Beliefs are the internal forces and strong intentions, which trigger individuals' actions and practices (Haney, Lumpe, & Czerniak, 2002). They are the self-information of an institution, a person, an event, or a behavior (Kane, Sandretto, & Heath, 2002). They are the understandings about what is felt to be factual (Valcke, Sang, Rots, & Hermans, 2010). They are the psychological understanding of self and environment (Boote, 2003). Research on teachers' beliefs shows that teachers' beliefs about teaching and learning shape up their learning to teach and thus has implications for educational reforms (Kane, Sandretto & Heath, 2002). Haney, Lumpe, and Czerniak (2002) assert whatever

\* University of Baltistan, Skardu Email: [hajikarim.khan@uobs.edu.pk](mailto:hajikarim.khan@uobs.edu.pk)

\*\* Email: [ishalbatool@gmail.com](mailto:ishalbatool@gmail.com)

\*\*\* Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan, Pakistan Email: [farahgillani@bzu.edu.pk](mailto:farahgillani@bzu.edu.pk)

teachers do in the classrooms is hugely influenced by what they believe about teaching and learning. Thus, teachers' beliefs have huge implications for students' achievements and teacher educators can play a pivotal role in shaping and reshaping teachers' beliefs about teaching and learning. There has been little known about what roles do teacher educators play to transform prospective teachers' beliefs about teaching and learning or how do they shape up their beliefs. The findings of this study, therefore, are of paramount importance for teacher education in developing country contexts and elsewhere.

We took the lens of cultural perspectives (Bourdieu, 1996) to conduct the study. Bourdieu (1996) uses the term 'habitus' that influences individuals' background, thinking, perspectives, beliefs, and practices. The habitus is constructed based on one's background education and experience, interactions, and workplace environment. That means prospective teachers construct their beliefs about teaching through restructuring, redefining, and reinterpreting their earlier experience as students, as prospective teachers, and later, as teacher educators in pre-service teacher education programs. Besides, the changing culture of teacher education provision in the country (Khan, 2009, Khan, 2011), also seems to influence the thinking and practices of these teacher educators.

Thus, we see teacher educators as critical, thinking agents who construct their understanding of teacher education based on the interaction of their old and new experiences in a teacher education program (Noel, 1993). Noel (ibid) refers to the notion of 'practical reasoning' through which prospective teachers construct their learning under the facilitation and support of their teacher educators. From the practical reasoning perspective, a teacher educator needs to know the goals, desires, and beliefs, past experiences, knowledge, emotions, and intentions of the prospective teachers as well as the present situation. Thus, teacher educators need to be facilitators of the learning process by engaging them in activities that result in their paradigm shift. In doing so, teacher educators' thinking and beliefs, which have been formed over time due to a particular habitus, influence their practices to shape up prospective teachers' beliefs.

Volcker, Sang, Rots, and Hermans (2010) are of the view that teacher educators facilitate the teaching-learning process among prospective teachers. They emphasize the importance of teacher educators to embrace modernized concepts of teaching and transform them into real practices, thus facilitating the learning process among prospective teachers.

The question is, how teacher educators can adopt such roles and practices. During the teacher education programs, teacher educators design different activities for the prospective teachers. Such activities and practices of the teacher educators referred to as psychotherapeutic concepts and the role of teacher educators is seen as that of belief-and-attitude therapists; which they are taking as a new academic field, involving their practices (Boote, 2003). Boote (2003) further argues that teacher educators have become belief-therapists; whereas, most of them are poorly prepared to adopt the role.

Developing and strengthening the practices of novice teachers depends heavily on good mentorship which, indeed, requires a lot of expertise and investment of time (Khan, & Halai, 2009). Prospective teachers are taught and guided in pedagogy while helping them to overcome their learning difficulties by their mentors (Wilson 2006).

Chai (2010) argues to transform the teaching and learning beliefs of prospective teachers, teacher educators need to know how prospective teachers learn and grow in the professional programs and what strategies should they adopt in transforming the pedagogical and epistemological belief of the prospective teachers (Valcke, Sang, Rots, & Hermans, 2010).

There is little known about teacher educators' role in Pakistan (Khan, 2011), this study, therefore, adds value to the development of knowledge on the role of teacher educators in general and that of teacher educators as belief transformers in particular.

### **The Changing Culture of Teacher Education in Pakistan**

The teacher education colleges in Pakistan showcase an institutional maze (Khan, 2009). There are various types of institutions including departments of education in the universities, Institutes for Education and Research (IERs), Government Colleges of Education (GCE), and Government Elementary Colleges of Education (GECEs). University departments offer Bachelor's, Master's, and Ph.D. level programs. GCE and IRS offer Bachelor's and Master's programs too. However, the GECEs were initially offering one-year-long Primary Teaching Certificate (PTC) and Certificate of Teaching (CT) programs. In the recent past, these programs have been replaced with the two-year

diploma programs called Associate Degree in Education (ADE) and four-year B.Ed. (Elementary) programs.

In the year 2002, through an ordinance, the government of Pakistan established the Higher Education Commission (HEC) to reform and revamp higher education in the country. The establishment of HEC has become a catalyst in bringing about reforms in the universities and other higher education institutions. As a result, changing culture and milieu seem to emerge in the educational institutions, resulting in a change in the role perceptions of faculty members, too. Later on, in the year 2007 the Higher Education Commission, through a Federal Government Notification, established an accreditation council to ensure quality teacher education in the country through reforming and revamping various teacher education programs. The council is called National Accreditation Council for Teacher Education (NACTE). The council emphasizes licensing teacher education programs, policy-making and streamlining teacher education, accrediting departments and programs, and encouraging research work in the institutions. Such reform initiatives at the national level, have also become instrumental for changes in the traditional culture of teaching and learning in the teacher education colleges. As a result, the cultures of teacher education colleges also saw waves of changes in their mandates and practices. Teacher educators saw a sudden shift from some traditional ways of teaching to more transformative modes. Their beliefs about teacher education, educating the prospective teachers, and bringing about changes in the prospective teachers' beliefs about teaching and learning, kept on changing.

### **Research design and context**

In this research study, we employed a qualitative approach to explore the practices, experiences, and role of the teacher educators in transforming prospective teachers' beliefs in formal teacher education programs in a remote region of Pakistan. Qualitative research helped us explore how individual teacher educators construe their roles and experiences, how they construct their lives, and what meaning they give to their experiences (Merriam, 2009).

We employed purposive sampling strategies to identify and select teacher educators for the study. Eleven teacher educators participated from a teacher education institution in a remote region in Pakistan. The institution offers a two-year-long pre-service teacher education program to elementary school teachers. After completion of Grad 12, prospective teachers can enroll in the program. The program consists of both theory and practice. The prospective teachers spend a considerable amount of time in school during their practicum. Generally, senior teachers are transferred from high schools to such colleges as teacher educators. These colleges are managed by the Directorate of Education of the provincial government. These teacher educators were engaged in a former teacher education program titled Associate Degree in Education (ADE). This is a two-year-long program aiming to develop teachers for elementary schools. There were above 100 students in the college most of them (80%) were girls.

The teacher educators who participated in this study had a minimum five-year experience as teacher educators. Given the ethical considerations of the qualitative study, we have used pseudonyms for the teacher educators. We got prior consent and permission from the college management to begin our fieldwork. We also got informed consent from all the individual teacher educators for participation in the study. All the teacher educators participated in the study voluntarily.

Qualitative data are retrieved from people's understanding, views, feelings, and life experiences, (Eisner, 1998); through observations, interviews, and discussions providing detailed descriptions of their activities, performances, and events (Merriam, 2009). In this study, we used semi-structured interviews and classroom observations. These data collection methods helped us making a strong description of the research question as well as making sure the rigor and trustworthiness of the findings. Interviews recount life histories and experiences reconstructing and rethinking memories or events of someone and (Merriam, 2009).

### **Data collection and analysis**

We interviewed each of the teacher educators for about ninety minutes in two to three different intervals. We used audiotape to record interviews of the participants. We transcribed the recorded data to develop the transcripts for analysis. The transcription of the recorded interviews highlighted the role perceptions and experiences of the teacher educators in transforming prospective teachers' beliefs about teaching and learning.

We also generated data through classroom observations and during the school visit for practicum. Merriam, (2009) asserted that observation is part of our common-sense interaction in routine life with the outer world. We observed teacher educators in their classrooms. We maintained records of writing observation. All these were non-participative observations as we did not interact with the teacher educators during the observations. We sat at the back of the classrooms and observed the lesson being taught. We maintained written records of the teaching and learning situations and teacher educators' interactions with the prospective teachers. The purpose was to engage the teacher educators in reflection just after the class during post-observation interviews. Such observations enabled us to ask questions based on our observations.

We also maintained field notes which gave us rich information. Personal notes or field notes are generally maintained to observe participants' activities; and are generally maintained directly in the field.

Data analysis remained emerging and continued simultaneously with the data collection (Miles & Huberman, 1994). We kept on arranging the data in a consequential pattern while raising the discussions and drawing conclusions out of it.

In this study, we first transcribed the data and conducted the thematic analysis. Reading through the transcripts and observation notes, enabled us to come up with certain themes related to the focus of our study. We developed and interpreted those themes for more polished, and developed themes of the study.

The use of a variety of approaches during the fieldwork including interviews, observations, and our field notes enabled us to address questions of validity and reliability, which are generally known as trustworthiness and rigor of the study (Eisner, 1998). The use of different approaches was instrumental in the triangulation of the data collected.

### **Findings**

It surfaced that teacher educators' beliefs about teaching and learning tend to be nested in their own experience of classroom teaching as well as the contemporary demands of changing the culture of teacher education in the country. As a result, they seem to reinterpret and redefine their roles in transforming the beliefs of prospective teachers about teaching and learning. All the teacher educators in the study saw teaching and learning as an engaging exercise whereby individuals construct their knowledge through actions, interactions, and reflections. Noor, a woman teacher educator reflected:

"I try to develop the student teachers as self-directed and independent learners! I believe that knowledge must be generated rather than given. So, I try to develop these beliefs in the student teachers as well so that they can engage their students in learning by doing."

In the above extract, the teacher educator tends to see her role as providing a platform for learning and create an environment for the prospective teachers to become independent learners. In doing so, her own earlier experience learning as a classroom teacher seems to influence her thinking and practice. Another participant, Ahmad, reflected on teaching and learning and said:

"Teaching and learning has strong roots in the traditional culture of teaching and learning in the schools. Now, the traditional culture is changing, and our teachers need to develop a repertoire of progressive ways of teaching. Therefore, I always try to develop the prospective teachers to be able to learn based on reflections on their own experience. I engage the prospective teachers in critical thinking."

Thus, engaging prospective teachers in learning through reflective practice seem to be the key element of the teacher educators' practices. Engaging the learners in critical thinking, once again, surfaced strongly in this reflection referring to teacher educators to take teaching as their promise and commitment while fulfilling the demand and need of the prospective teachers. Sara, a woman teacher educator also reflected almost in the same lines:

"Being a teacher educator, I try to give a variety of learning opportunities to my students by using audio and visual aids, multimedia presentations, library visits, role plays, and field visits. I do this because I believe that students learn more when they are involved."

Once again, in the above reflection, the teacher educator seems to be aware of the changing culture of teaching and learning. As a result, she prefers to engage the prospective teachers in learning through the use of various approaches. During the fieldwork, we also observed that teacher educators took a group of the students to a local university department, a college, and a language center to give them opportunities to interact with their counterparts in those institutions.

All the research participants advocated the notion of engaging the learners in the learning process through critical thinking, reflective practice, and discovery, and exploration. They tend to inculcate such notions in the prospective teachers. In doing so, teacher educators saw their roles in a variety of ways, which are discussed below.

***Teacher educators as scaffolders of the new concepts***

It surfaced that teacher educators' key role was scaffolding the prospective teachers' concepts about teaching and learning. They felt that generally prospective teachers came to the teacher education program with some crude conceptions about teaching and learning. Therefore, the teacher educators saw their roles as scaffolders of content, pedagogy, and professional skills of the prospective teachers. They felt that teaching practicum was the most important element of the program that allowed them to scaffold the novel concepts among the prospective teachers.

For instance, Noor reflected upon her role as a scaffolder and said:

"I can say that the teaching practicum is the application of theory that allows us to strengthen the newer concepts. For example, to become a nurse a person needs to join any nursing program in a teaching hospital. She learns and develops knowledge and skills related to her profession. Likewise, the application of teaching methods can be achieved during teaching practicum under the supervision of the teacher educators."

Thus, the research participants felt that the prospective teachers needed support to develop and strengthen the new concepts about teaching and learning. In doing so, the teaching practicum played a key role whereby teacher educators scaffold the learning of the students. Kamran also reflected on his role as a scaffolder:

"I believe that our teachers need to explore the abilities and skills of the students. It is good that our ADE [Associate Degree in Education] program is on a practical basis. We are supposed to strengthen the learning through our support. They need our support in doing so."

Ahmad also reflected on his role as a scaffolder:

"In our teacher education program, we focus more on the practical aspects. Practical means teaching in a real classroom situation. If we emphasis only on the theory, it would not give a fruitful outcome."

The above reflections showcase the importance of scaffolding the knowledge and skills of the prospective teachers during their practicum. Sara also shared her reflections about the scaffolding and said, "during the practicum, we support our prospective teachers how to plan a lesson, how to deliver them, how to motivate the students towards learning."

All the research participants saw their role as scaffolders of new knowledge and skills of the prospective teachers in real classroom situations. They believed that prospective teachers needed scaffolding and time to learn and practice the new concepts of teaching and learning. They realized the importance of the practices to scaffold the professional skill in the prospective teachers. Our analysis of the recent curriculum of B.Ed. (Hons.) and the ADE program (Higher Education Commission, 2012) also showcased the importance of practicum in the program.

***Teacher educators as role models***

Teacher educators in the study also saw themselves as role models for prospective teachers. They felt that their students consider them as their inspirations and role models for themselves. They explained how they work as role models for prospective teachers. Maira reflected:

"Let me give you an example, suppose if an English language teacher teaches in Urdu then how will the students learn the target language! Therefore, our practices should be linked with what we say. Only teaching about teaching will not be enough to change beliefs about teaching, we need to be role models."

The above piece of reflection shows how teacher educators see themselves as role models for their prospective teachers. It shows that for a positive paradigm shift, role modeling is imperative. Sara shared:

"Seeing myself as a role model, I believe that I should be punctual, regular, and do myself what I say. If we do so, our prospective teachers will also become role models for their students. I believe that imitation is like human beings. It is a saying in Urdu that *kherboozay ko dekh kr kherboozay rang pakerta hay* [when the old cock crows the young cock learns]."

Thus, teacher educators believe that the prospective teachers also learned from the actions and behaviors of their teacher educators and the norms and values of the college culture and milieu. Therefore, it was realized that teacher educators need to be role models of the best practices.

Aman also reflected on his role and practices as a role model for his prospective teachers and said:

"I consider myself as a role model for my students. To become a role model, I must have appropriate knowledge, skills, and expertise. Secondly, I must be competent and update myself with relevant knowledge and skills. Thirdly, I must have pedagogical skills and knowledge in terms of what to teach, how to teach where and when to teach."

Thus, Aman's reflection has highlighted three aspects of teacher educators' practices and behaviors. Firstly, as teacher educators, they need to have synchronization in their saying and doing. Secondly, inspiring the prospective teachers through a stronghold on content and pedagogy. And thirdly, having a strong repertoire of professional and pedagogical skills.

To conclude, all the research participants in the study construed themselves as role models for their prospective teachers. They saw themselves as role models for their prospective teachers, to transform their beliefs about teaching and learning. They believed that their actions and behaviors strongly influence the prospective teachers in the long run to become effective teachers.

#### ***Teacher educators as counselors***

Teacher educators in the study construed their roles as the counselor for the prospective teachers. They felt that teaching was not limited to the classroom; rather, it was about nurturing the personal and professional aspects of the prospective teachers. They felt that they were performing the role of a counselor in transforming their prospective teachers' beliefs about teaching and learning. During the field visits, we often saw teacher educators giving individual counseling to certain prospective students. Noor, a woman teacher educator reflected:

"Sometimes students come to me and ask where to go for further studies and which university to select. It means that they consider us as counselors and seek guidance related to their education and career."

This reflection shows what makes a teacher educator perform the role of a counselor and how to guide the students related to their personal lives and professional career. Ahmad also mentioned:

"Sometimes, I face problems in dealing with the prospective teachers in the classrooms when they do not give a response and do not show their interest. In this kind of situation, I give extra time to them after the class. I deal with them individually in my office."

In the above reflection, the teacher educator has highlighted the need for counseling and advocates the importance of counseling the prospective teachers on an individual basis to help them continue their learning in a conducive environment.

Ikram, another teacher, also reflected:

"I cannot separate counseling from my role as a teacher educator. Most of our students come from a culture of traditional teaching and learning. Thus, when they come across new approaches, methods, and strategies of teaching, they get confused and need further support. Here they need our support and counseling."

The friendly and caring nature of teacher educators which allows prospective teachers to go to them, share their issues, and seek solutions is illuminated in the above reflection by a teacher educator. Sara, a woman teacher educator also reflected and said, "The prospective teachers learn

newer concepts about teaching and learning. In their learning of the newer concepts about teaching and learning, prospective teachers always need counseling.”

Thus, teacher educators do not see their responsibilities limited to the classes; rather, sometimes, they work as counselors for the social, moral, and psychological development of the prospective teachers. They feel that the traditional culture of teaching and learning is changing. The prospective teachers need to have a culture in the college that endorses and encourages innovative ways of learning.

#### ***Teacher educators as storytellers and listeners***

Data revealed that teacher educators also work as storytellers and listeners to their prospective teachers. It surfaced that in the schools during the practicum this role becomes more prominent. The teacher educators tell stories from their own lives and listen to the stories of prospective teachers. In all the classroom observations during the fieldwork, we found teacher educators telling stories from their own lives. They told stories of how they were being taught and how they learned from anecdotes of life experiences.

Noor reflected:

“Most of the time, I try to involve the prospective teachers in thinking and reflecting upon their practices and telling stories of their learning. I provide time to them in the class as well as out outside, so that they share their stories with me and with the class and learn from the stories of others.”

The above extract showcases the role of a teacher educator providing a platform for telling and listening to stories. It is an interactive process whereby teacher educators and prospective teachers become storytellers and listeners to each other. This results in knowing about the best practices, identifying areas for improvements, and zeroing on those areas. Ahmad reflected and shared:

“Our alumni members are working in different public and private sector institutions. Whenever they have problems in any aspect, they contact us for feedback. This means that they consider us as mentors, they do not shy away to share their issues and problems with us.”

The above reflection shows the trust and confidence among the prospective teachers to consult the teacher educators even after their graduation. All the teacher educators in the study realized the importance of sharing their own stories with the prospective teachers and also listening to their stories. Most of them shared that during the practicum the prospective teachers face any challenges and problems they contact the teacher educators, in such cases the teacher educators' role as listeners and supporters become important.

#### **Discussion of the findings**

Findings showcased that to bring about changes in the teaching and learning beliefs of prospective teachers, the teacher educators engage them in real-life situations through scaffolding their learning. The interplay of teacher educators' own previous learning experience, their interaction with the present-day concepts of teacher learning, and the contemporary demands for teachers (equipped with modern knowledge, skills, and approaches to teaching), seems to create a culture in the teacher education college with changing norms, values, and expatiations. Thus, this ever-changing and dynamic nature of culture in the college seems to inform the practices of teacher educators to bring about changes in the beliefs of prospective teachers about teaching and learning. As a result, teacher educators seem to see their roles as role models, mentors, counselors, storytellers, and listeners.

Engaging the prospective teachers in the practicum enables them to make decisions based on concrete judgments (Haney, Lumpe, & Czerniak, 2002). Other contemporary researchers also assert that teachers' beliefs about teaching-learning are formed during their professional development programs and by their learning to teach (Kane, Sandretto & Heath 2002; Donaghue, 2003). It is the nature and philosophy of teaching which transforms effectively the teachers' belief during the teacher education programs (Donaghue, 2003; Valcke, Sang, Rots, & Hermans, 2010).

It surfaced that teacher educators give more consideration and weightage to the teaching practicum whereby they provide the prospective teachers with a carrying culture through to innovate, explore and learn through reflections on their practices. They feel that such conducive and comforting culture provides the prospective teachers with opportunities to question their own beliefs and to transform them accordingly. Findings from Wilson (2006) also reinforce such findings as teacher educators develop the prospective teachers towards effective teaching by giving greater weightage to

teaching practices. Kane, Sandretto, and Heath (2002) also assert that it is the teaching beliefs and teaching practices that integrally complete the concept of teaching.

In the run to meet the changing cultural demands, teacher educators in the study needed to role models for their prospective teachers. Findings showcased that teacher educators need to have a strong repertoire of content, and pedagogy, as well as have relevant skills and inspire their students by being a role model for them. Literature also supports such findings. For example, Timmerman (2009) also found that in a study, teacher educators saw themselves as role models for their prospective teachers having a stronghold on content and pedagogy. Similarly, James (2001) also came up with a conclusion that the teacher educators must be practical during the professional development programs because their beliefs and practices influence the prospective teachers' beliefs.

It was found that in transforming the prospective teachers' beliefs about teaching and learning, teacher educators construe their roles as mentors; facilitating them not only in their academic and professional development but also in their progress through listening to their stories and sharing experience from their personal lives. Khan and Halai (2009) found that mentors work as coaches, critical friends, and subject experts.

Likewise, the role of teacher educators as counselors, storytellers, and listeners also surfaced. In the transforming beliefs, teacher educators not only tell stories from their own lives and experiences but also make themselves available to listen to the prospective teachers' stories. As counselors, they provide guidance related to the prospective teachers' personal and professional lives. In short, by transforming the beliefs of the prospective teachers, teacher educators become good listeners to understand the goals, desires, and beliefs, past experiences, knowledge, emotions, and intentions of the prospective teachers. Noel (1993) refers to such concerns as 'practical reasoning'. Knowing such details enables the teacher educators to facilitate the prospective teachers in their paradigm shift about teaching and learning. This aspect of their practice gives confidence to the prospective teachers and also enables the teacher educators to know the areas of improvement, give feedback, and scaffold the learning.

### **Conclusion**

In transforming the prospective teachers' beliefs about teaching and learning, this study has investigated the teacher educators' role. Teacher educators seem to be role models for their prospective teachers and believe that what and how they do, strongly influences the teaching and learning beliefs of the prospective teachers. In doing so, they tend to take the roles of counselors, storytellers, and listeners. Future studies may focus on the role of teacher educators to transform the belief of the in-service teachers during professional development programs.

Given the interaction of teacher educators earlier learning experiences (more traditional), and the contemporary demands of changing the culture of teacher education in the country (more progressive ways of teaching and learning), reflection on their learning as teachers, helps them to put themselves into the shoes of the prospective teachers and engage them in productive learning opportunities. In doing so, they admired the practicum experience that enables the prospective teachers to rethink and conceptualizing their beliefs about teaching.

### **References**

- Ball, D.L. (2000). Bridging Practices Intertwining Content and Pedagogy in Teaching and Learning to Teach. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 51(3), 241–247.
- Bingimals, K., & Hanrahan, M. (2010). The relationship between teachers' beliefs and their practice: How the literature can inform science education reformer and researchers. In M.F. Tasar & G. Cakmakci (Eds.), *Contemporary Science Education Research: International perspectives* (pp. 415-422). Ankara, Turkey: Pegem Academy
- Boote, D.N. (2003). Teacher Educators as Belief and Attitude therapists: Exploring Psychodynamic Implications of an Emerging Role. *Teachers and Teaching: theory and practices*, 9 (3), 257–277.
- Bourdieu, P. (1996). *Distinction: a social critique of the judgment of taste*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Brownlee, J. (2003). Change in Primary School Teachers, Belief about Knowledge: A Longitudinal Study, *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, 31(1), 87–98.



- Chai, C.S. (2010). Teachers' epistemic belief and their pedagogical belief: A qualitative case study among Singaporean teachers in the context of ICT-supported reforms. *Journal of Educational Technology*, 9(4), 128–139.
- Cooper, M. (1988). Whose culture is it, anyway? In A. Lieberman (ed.), *Building a professional culture in schools* (pp. 45-54). Teachers College, Columbia University, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Deal, T. E. & Peterson, K. D. (2009). *Shaping school cultures: Pitfalls, paradoxes, and promises*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Donaghue, H. (2003). An instrument to elicit teacher's beliefs and assumptions. *ELT Journal*, 57(4), 344–351.
- Eisner, E. W. (1998). *The enlightened eye: Qualitative inquiry and the enhancement of educational practice*. New Jersey: Prentice-Hall Inc.
- Goncalves, T. N. R., Azevedo, N. R., & Alves, M. G. (2013). Teachers' Belief about Teaching and Learning: An Exploratory Study. *Journal of Educational Research*, 2(1), 54–70.
- James, R. (2001). Teachers' belief and teaching belief. *Early Childhood Research and Practice*, 3(1), 2–11.
- Kane, R., Sandretto, S., Heath, C. (2002). Telling Half the Story: A Critical Review of Research on the Teaching Belief and Practices of University Academic. *Review of Educational Research*, 72(2), 177–228.
- Khan, H. K. (2009). *Becoming a teacher educator in public sector institutions in Pakistan: stories from personal and professional lives*. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation submitted to the Aga Khan University, Institute for Educational Development, Karachi, Pakistan.
- Khan, H. K., & Halai, A. (2009). Mentoring for teacher development: Experiences from in-service setting in Pakistan. In R. Qureshi & F. Shamim (Eds.), *Schools and Schooling Practices in Pakistan: Lessons from Research* (pp. 68 - 86). Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Khan, H. K. (2011). Becoming teacher educators in Pakistan: voices from the government colleges of education. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 37(3), 325–335.
- Liston, D., Borko, H., & Whitcomb, J. (2008). The Teacher Educators' Role in Enhancing Teacher Quality. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 59 (2), 111–116.
- Haney, J. J., Lumpe, A. T., & Czeniak, C.M. (2002). From belief to Action: The belief and action of teacher implementation. *Journal of Science Teacher Education*, 13(3), 171–187.
- Higher Education Commission (2012). *The curriculum of education: B.Ed. (Hons.) Elementary, ADE (Associate Degree in Education)*. Higher Education Commission, Islamabad, Pakistan.
- Maxwell, J. A. (2008). *Designing a Qualitative Study*. Applied research designs Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 214–253
- Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative Research: A Guide to Design and Implement*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis* (2nd Ed.). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Murray, J. (2006). Constructions of caring professionalism: a case study of teacher educators. *Gender and Education*, 18(4), 381–397.
- Noel, J. R. (1993). Practical Reasoning: Constructivist Theory and Practice in Teacher Education. Paper presented at the 1993 Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Atlanta, and (AERA).
- Oleson, A., & Hora, M. T. (2013). Teaching the way they were taught? Revisiting the sources of teaching knowledge and the role of prior experience in shaping faculty teaching practice. *Springer*, DOI 10.1007/s10734-013-9678-9
- Salo, A. (2015). Student-Teachers' And School-Based Teacher Educators' Beliefs About Teaching Practices and Instructional Goals. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 191, 2203–2212
- Seale, C., & Silverman, D. (1997). Ensuring Rigor in Qualitative Research. *European Journal of Public Health*, 7(4), 379–384.
- Swennen, A., Volman, M., & Essen, M. V. (2008). The development of the professional identity of two teacher educators in the context of Dutch teacher education. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 31 (2), 169 – 184.

- Thompson, S., & Ross, F. (2000). Becoming a Teacher in a Professional Development School. *Teaching and Change*, 8 (1), 31–50.
- Timmerman, G. (2009). Teacher educators modeling their teachers? *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 23(3), 225–238.
- Valcke, Martin & Guoyuan, Sang & Rots, Isabel & Hermans, Ruben. (2010). Taking Prospective Teachers' Beliefs into Account in Teacher Education. *International Encyclopedia of Education*.
- Wilson, S.M. (2006). Finding a canon and core meditation on the preparation of teacher educator-researchers. *Journal of Teacher Education*, (57)3, 315–325.