HISTORY OF EDUCATIONAL POLICY MAKING AND PLANNING IN PAKISTAN

Sadia Alvi, Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities Hamdard University, Karachi, Pakistan <u>sadia.sohaib66@gmail.com</u>

Kamal Haider, Department of Education, Federal Urdu University Karachi Pakistan. kmhrpk@gmail.com

Farooq Aziz, Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities Hamdard University, Karachi, Pakistan drfaziz@yahoo.com

Nazia Abdul Rehman, Benazir School of Business, Benazir Bhutto Shaheed University Lyari Karachi Pakistan. <u>nzshakir@gmail.com</u>

ABSTRACT:

The aim of this paper is to outline the concise history of educational polices with critical analysis of educational policy making in Pakistan from its commencement. The education system of Pakistan is found to be highly ineffective as compared to modern world. The main milestone in history of educational policies of Pakistan is National Education Conference conducted in 1947, the introduction of new education policy in 1970, five year based educational plans, education policy from 1972 to 1980, and national policy of education with implementation plan in 1979, new educational policy 1992 and national educational policy for period of1998 to 2010. In spite of explicit educational plan and policies the education sector of Pakistan has not developed so far. The main critical failure factor identified are lack of government will, ineffective monitoring, lack of resources, high corruption, poverty issues, ineffective bureaucratic structure and boom of private sector education. Therefore, the paper presented valuable recommendation to enhance the excellence and overall quality of entire educational system.

KEY WORDS: Educational Policy, National Policy of Education, Five-year Plan, Quality of Education System, Inadequate resources.

Introduction:

According to Singhal, et al (2003) educational policy can be defines as the government policy and principles in sphere of education and based on collection of rules and law for governing the educational system operations. The various format of education are childhood education, primary school, secondary school, graduate, adult education and professional education. The educational policy assures that citizen belongs to all age group must have practical physical and financial accessibility towards a enrich range of opportunities in post-secondary education. The main purpose of educational policy is the improvement in academic success of students by reinforcing standard oriented reforms and mainly includes measures of accountability and assessments. The aim of this paper is to present the brief outline of history of educational polices with critical overview of educational policy making as well as planning in Pakistan from its inception. The main milestone in history of educational policies of Pakistan.

1. History of Educational Policy in Pakistan

2.1 Educational Policy from 1947 to 1959

Pakistan attain independence from British rule in August 1947 and at that time the Pakistani region was comparatively backward in diverse perspective specifically

education. In 1947, "All Pakistan Education Conference" was conducted to design the education al system structure in Pakistan (Rozi, Akhtar, Sajid, & Khan, 2005). Due to illness Quaid-e-Azam could not be present at this conference but he conveyed his message for suggestion in educational polices. The educational system must be focused on talented and genius people of Pakistan and must be consonant with culture and history with inculcation of excellent sense of integrity and honor and must keep a high focus in the field of science and technology. In addition, educational system must be aligned with Islamic values (Rahman, 1997).

Jafarey, Ardee, & Satterthwaite, (1968) critiques that this policy could not be implemented adequately because of increased immigrant number and varied administration problem as a new state hence British system more or less continued in educational field. In this conference, various committees were formed for the prosperity of primary as well as secondary education. The committees emphasized the fact that educational system must be based on sturdy and well-built foundation of compulsory and free education.

In year 1951 another conference was conducted for the adoption of six-year plan for national development of education and includes the time span of 1951 to 1957. This plan was considered as the first important effort for the deliberation and anticipation of varied educational requirement. Rationally this plan again identified the constraints and issues such as absence of well trained teachers especially in primary school (Fatima, & Nasr, 2010). This plan suggested that about 2.8 million should be literate each year by means of V-AID (Village Agricultural & Industrial Development) initiative and different literacy centers were established and teaching material was provided to teachers (Talbani, 1996). However, the expenditure and efforts were failed in this decade to achieve desirable outcomes. The review of efforts in long decade entail that rate of literacy remain unchanged rather it was declined. In 1950a the literacy rate decreases from 0.1% from 16.4% to 16.3% after intact decade (Mahmood, 2003).

The letdown was credited to high instability of organizational and administrative arrangements. The first 5 year plan was launched after 2.5 year in end of 1957 and accompanied that a harmonized and primary education system is imperative. The plan also highlighted that primary education is vital for preparation of citizen to discharge the civic and democratic responsibilities and gives equal opportunities for cultural and economic progression and advancement (Papanek, 1967). The content and quality of primary teaching was found to be highly poor and various provisions were made for training of teacher, development of curriculum for primary education with constitution of local management committee for school. The national commission of education 1959 recommended the building character and bifurcation of subject as core and additional subjects and also clearly mentioned that national language is considered as the medium of instruction and high focus will be given to science and technology education and

examination system includes 25% internal and 75% external evaluation (Niazi, & Mace, 2006). The 1959 policy clearly mentioned that religious education can be deployed in three phases that can be obligatory for middle level, optional for secondary level and as a part of research on university level. The duration of degree program is based on three years and grant commission of university will be established (Fikree, & Gray, 1996). Khan, & Mahmood, (1997) criticizes that in spite of the fact that educational policy of 1959 is excellent and effective; however, it is failed because of absence of adequate planning and execution. The 3-year degree program created an unrest situation in students as well as in parents and soon withdrawn.

2.2. Educational Policy from 1960 to 1970

The salient feature of educational policy in 1970 are mainly focused over the ideological orientation, science and technology education, decentralization of educational management, illiteracy eradication and development of national corporation for education. This policy was not deployed due to governmental change (Alavi, 1972). The second five-year plan was presented for the duration of 1960 to 1965 and based on the objective of 1959 policy. The main objectives of this plan were based on the trained manpower, responsible citizen by creation of educated community. In second plan about Rs 990, million were allocated and it was anticipated to increase the proportion of children to attend school till 1965. It provided the opening of about new 15,200 primary schools along with current 18,000 schools. As an effect, in West Pakistan the enrolment was reached up to 1.2 million and rate of primary education increased from 36% to 56%.

Moreover, the content of curriculum also improved, increased provision for teacher as well as training materials. A special attention was given to female education as that time out of 4.7 million the attendance of girls in primary school was found to be only 1.1 million. In addition, separate facilities were given to girls. In third five-year plan ranges from 1965 to 1970 about Rs 2652 million rupees were allocated for primary education. The main goals of this plan were the based on improved transition in discipline of science and technology, promotion of socio-economic and political growth and effort to improve the cultural and spiritual heritage in harmonization with modern world. To enable the youth of state with highly conducive condition regarding the full fledge growth of individual character and capacities. The utmost aim was to improve the educational quality on varied level for fulfillment of building task of nations.

Another explicit policy was introducing in 1970 that affirms the commitment of government to fulfill the objective of universal elementary education for the acceptance of fundamental principle of state policy in 1956 and 1962 constitution. It is also conforming to Karachi plan of 1960 that suggested the universal, compulsory and free primary education by year 1980. However, in spite of all these initiatives, all efforts go in vain and brought no significant improvement in literacy rate of Pakistan. The policy was intended for the universal and free enrolment till class five by year 1980 with specific

stress on education of girls. It was also observed that about 100 million illiterates were belong to rural areas. The policy was also intended to cover up the 5 million adults by 1975 and enquire about employer and mainly government to offer work centric fundamental education for all of its human resources and most important factor is the establishment of national education corporation. However, this policy was never employed due to separation of East Pakistan and collapse with military government.

2.3. Educational Policy from 1971 to 1980

The educational policy of 1972-1980 was mainly based on ideology promotion in Pakistan, development of personality, educational equality, universal education and curriculum based on society socio-economic needs, well integrated science and technical education and active contribution of students, teachers and parent in affairs of education and most important factor is the nationalization of educational institutes (Zia, 2003). This policy revealed an effective approach for improvement in education, however it is also subjected to different drawbacks that were difficult to accomplish thoroughly such as trends for agro-technical education and basic universal education (Warwick, Reimers, & McGinn, 1992).

The fifth 5-year plan was presented for the duration of 1978 to 1983 to further improve the neglected area of education in Pakistan. The main element is the improvement in literacy rate that is essential for the socio-economic contribution. This policy adopted a comprehensive approach for the improvement in primary education and reinforce the augmentation of physical facilities at school and other proactive measure to decreases the rate of drop rate, improvement in overall quality of teaching with improved provision.

The policy also recommended the improvement in the educational expenses from Rs 43 per capita to Rs 88 from 1978 to 1983 and improves the education outlay from 2% to 3.1% of GNP. Another dominant element was to decrease the drop out ratio from 50% to 40% and improvement in girl's education. The plan mentioned that registration of girls is projected to increase with 9.6% yearly in contrast with 7% for boy's. As the consequence of this plan the enrolment of education increased from 33% to 45%. This plan was specifically elaborated for the adult education and recommended to establish about 10,000 literacy centers for adult in sponsorship with Pakistani Ministry of education, Television centers of Pakistan, Allama Iqbal university centers, as well as other centers for social welfare. The likelihood of volunteer corps for students includes graduate and master level. It was projected that this plan will increase the level of literacy from 24% to 35% till year 1986 with attainment of 100% literacy rate by year 2010.

In year 1979, another educational policy was introduced in national education conference. The policy was aimed at encouragement of loyalty with Islam; build the concept of Muslim Ummah, equal opportunities, endorsement of science and technical education. In order to achieve this aim, few strategies were recommended such

as revision of Curriculum revision, merging of traditional and madarsa, Urdu as educational medium, effective contribution of community for literacy based programs, connection of technical and scientific education, separate instate for female and male and Mosque schools. However, this policy was not implemented effectively and failed due to absence of financial resources and planning (Shamim, 2008).

2.4. Educational Policy from 1981 to 1990

The decade of year 1980s brought significant initiatives in discipline of literacy and education in Pakistan. The main highlight of this decade entail that in year 1981 a LAMEC (The literacy and mass education commission) was established and ten points based educational plan was suggested with sixth 5-year plan. In addition, the National literacy plan was also launched in 1984. In year 1985, Literacy ordinance plan was publicized with levied of Iqra Tax with launch of Drop in school. In year 1986, another program of literacy on nationwide level was initiated and in year 1988 another five-year plan was presented. In 1989, LAMEC was reorganized as "National Education & Training Commission" (Uslaner, & Rothstein, 2016).

In year 1983, a national workshop was conducted by administrator of Martial law based on female literacy. The ten points were the yearly drive in summer as a mass education plan by varied stakeholders such as government, armed forces, NGO and other should contribute, Graduate and post graduate must have imparted the Quranic Qaida, public sector was required to arrange literacy program for their employees. The illiterate prison that qualified for public organization will be given remission in prison term. The driving license and arms license will be given to only literate individual, rewards and incentive to village and in other rural area, trophies and reward for outstanding achievement in education, grant to NGO, Deeni education, and effective use of media such as Radio and TV for promotion of education (Usman, 2014).

The sixth 5 year plan for 1983 to 1988 proclaimed the importance of education, review of past educational plans, high focused on girl's education and for ignored rural areas, mass literacy program, use of Mosque for accommodation of class one to three for overcrowded and new schools, provision of building for shelter less school, building construction in urban areas, mix enrolment system, separate school provision for girls, two teacher for all 5 classes and formation of implementation agencies for promotion of primary education at Provincial, Federal, and consequent levels. Moreover, two-year base 1984-1986 national literacy plan was also launched with worth of Rs 317 million in order to further improve the rate of literacy from 26% to 33%. According to this plan about twenty-five thousand literacy centers were established in assistance from concerned provisional literacy council and non-governmental enterprises. Another important scheme was Iqra project that aimed to literate the people by direct relation among teacher and student at any adequate place and as per their convenient time. A 1000 Rs incentive was

given to teacher and it was claimed that about nineteen thousand turn out to be literate from this program (Oppenheim, & Stambach, 2014).

However, Sharma, Shaukat, & Furlonger, (2015) argued that Iqra project was not implemented properly and significant deficiencies were observed in monitoring of this plan. In year 1985 another 3 year based program named "Drop in School" was initiated in nine selected district to achieve the literacy rate of 53%. Various literacy centers were opened in town and villages in 89 districts. This program was overhaul by Nai Roshni Schools for the time period of 1986 to 1990. It was also overtaken by another scheme called Nai Roshni Schools as the extension of Drop in school. It is based on non-formal education plan and includes the condensed courses that are equal to formal education. As an affect the literacy rate increases up to 1990.

The 7th five-year plan was introduced in year 1988 and intended to improve the infrastructure of physical and human resource by offering facilities to shelter less school and addition of class room in over-crowded schools. All primary school must have minimum 3 teachers and 2 classrooms and a veranda. A comfortable sitting arrangement is provided to all primary schools. In this instance, Ahmad, Said, Hussain, & Khan, (2014) argued that despite of all efforts; education system of Pakistan was suffering from chronic drawbacks and lead to perpetuation of greater literacy rate and majority of children have no accessibility of education. The primary school was still lacking in physical facilities and about twenty-nine thousand primary schools were without building and sixteen thousand schools have only one class room.

2.5. Educational Policy from 1991 to 2000

In 1992-2002, another national educational policy was introducing that mainly intended on Islamic value promotion by education, enhancement in feminist education, diversification of technical and general education on secondary level, demand based curriculum, expanded scope of graduate and post graduate, utilization of AV aids to promote the private sector for participation in literacy enhancement. This policy was not effectively implemented because of changes in political scenario of state (Mahboob, 2009). The Eight plans were launched in 1993 and proclaimed that education is the essential element of growth and basic right of all individual. The plan opined that about one fifth boys and half of girls were not enrolled in primary school with barely literacy rate of about 35%. The educational plan was also intended to improve the overall quality of education.

However, Amjad, & Burke, (2015) criticizes that in spite of adequate growth in number of varied educational institutes, the desirable goals achieved partially. The mainstream of educational institutes was established without appropriate infrastructure. The situation of current infrastructure of education has dilapidated and deteriorated due to lack of adequate maintenance. About thirty-five thousand schools contain no shelter and majority of schools are lacking in indispensable facilities for instance potable water,

teaching aids and others. The educational standard is far from satisfactory level and curriculum is lacking in relevance. Moreover, instruction methodologies as well as testing are out modeled. In addition, an imbalance is observed among quality and availability of varied facilities of education. The rate of failure and drop out specifically at terminal level are continuously quite greater.

Another National education policy was introduced for 1998-2010. The main goals and objectives of this policy were to make the Islamic and Quranic principle as the integral element of educational system, to accomplish the universal and primary education, to fulfill the fundamental educational requirement of each and all individual, expansion of fundamental education, to assure the equal employment opportunity for higher education, focused over the diversification, to make development of curriculum as the ongoing and continuous process, introduction of in-house training plan for improvement in education. Following recommendation were made in order to achieve this objective such as curriculum diversification, emphasis and expansion on science and technical education, quality improvement in Islamic Madaras, training program for pre and in-house service, conception of multiple text books and implementation of comprehensive system of monitoring (Manan, Dumanig, & David, 2015).

2.6. Educational Policy from 2001 to 2010

For the duration of 2001-2005, the main focus of national policy was intended on growth and development of human resource. The prime importance is given to proliferation of compulsory education, free availability of text books, equal accessibility for learning opportunity, improvement in entire perspective of high quality education, introduction of new curricula of education, development of material for training and other resources for learning, incentives for private sector for the promotion of education, and most important factor is the introduction of computer on overall levels, amplification in research for higher education and offer grants for Madarsa affiliation (Tamim, 2014). The time horizon for national education policy ranged from 2009 to 2015. The dominant feature of national policy was aimed at varied polices and reforms related to coordinated and well integrated inter provincial activities. Haqqani, (2015) argued that past educational policies were not followed by adequate implementation plan with incomplete monitoring and feedback. For the prevention against failure, a framework for implementation with feedback and follow up mechanism were integrated in NEP for 2009 to 2015. A separate action plan is designed for each province and issues raised in UNESCO institute were also addressed in this plan such as development and growth of education, consideration of equity, curriculum revision, financing and cost of education, incorporation of information system for policy evaluation and monitoring. Razzaq, (2016) criticizes that implementation of NEP is restricted to framework development. There is no harmonization among feasibility, affordability and desirability.

2.7. Educational Policy from 2011 to 2016

In year 2013, the government introduces the national plan of action. The purpose of plan is to improve the pace of education related MDGs (2013-2016). The plan aimed to enhance the enrolment of school in primary sector of education, to increase the rate of retention and education completion of enrolled children and to improve the quality of overall primary education. The national plan is also consolidated with eight provincial areas and specific for domestic challenges and other interventions. The plan also envisages the improvement in enrolment in primary education from 68% to 91% from 2012 to 2016. The main strategies of this plan are based on new student enrolment in current schools, additional room provision, and new school establishment, incentive to attract and retain the students specifically girls such as food for education, stipends, uniforms and others (Cloughley, 2016).

3. Critical Analysis of Educational Policies of Pakistan

By the independence of Pakistan in 1947, about 85% population of Pakistan was entirely illiterate and situation of female and backwards areas were quite worsening. The main step in educational growth of Pakistan was the 1947 National Education Conference, first, second and third 5-year plan and NEP policy for time span of 1998 to 2010. For all development plans the Pakistani government has made critical commitment for improvement in literacy rate and assures the compulsory education from the grass root level. However not all of such commitments were fully materialized (Ahmad, Said, Hussain, & Khan, 2014). From the overview of historic analysis in Pakistan indicates that only minor and ineffective progress is observed to improve the literacy rate of Pakistan from 1947 to 1990s. Specifically from 1990 to 2005, some improvement has been observed. Since then the progress rate is found to be stagnant till 2012 where literacy rate reaches up to 58% that is quite unacceptable in contemporary world. Moreover, significant disparities are observed in terms of literacy rate. About 48% male and 21% female from 1990 increases up to 47% female and 70% male in year 2012. However, rapid growth has been observed in private schools that constitute about 40% in overall Pakistan. The enrolment in private sector is elevating with the fast pace due to excellent and improved quality level of education. The public schools are lacking far behind in terms of quality education (Usman, 2014).

However, McLaren, (2015) argued that private education is quite expensive and majority of Pakistani people cannot afford the high quality education in Pakistan. The majority of Pakistani schools are of poor quality and dysfunctional, patchy infrastructure, low morale teachers and inappropriate human resource system, lack of technology and overall a lack of direction is observed in Overall Pakistani education systems. According to 18th amendment, the resources and power are devolved to provinces and currently provinces are required to deal with the effective use of new power. Hence, provinces are required to be strengthening in entire delivery program with respect to social sector.

The main reason for ineffective implementation of educational policies and poor performance of educational initiatives in entire history of Pakistan are discussed below.

3.1. Inappropriate Importance

Each and every year, the government gave abundant funds for financing of grants and scholarship to higher school and primary education sector was left to domestic province and authorities of federal government. Because of funds scarcity, the primary public sector is far behind the basic requirement and highly nonfunctional in nature. Moreover, extensive corruption was observed for managing the school of public sector. The higher education has received ample consideration and primary education sector was unattended. On grass root level, no serious effort has been made for effective execution of policies to assure the primary education quality. Because of absence of competence and management for running the entire network of public school the quality of curricula and of course education was found to be highly poor that lead to greater drop out ratio. In addition, the unavailability of effective teachers and insufficient qualification teachers are also responsible for ineffective implementation of educational plan and policies (Sheikh, & Ali, 2014).

3.2. Poor Monitoring

A serious contradiction is observed among declared policies by government and real steps to accomplish the commitment objectives. In another governmental policy of education, the significance of full attention is strongly emphasized. In addition, the target of achievement of literacy and student enrolment were prescribed, however no appreciable outcomes were accomplished. An attention was given to pace up the higher education with subsidized programs. The programs of higher education are intended for enrich people whereas the program of primary education was mainly for the common person welfare. The situation leads to resources misallocation with victimization of poor man (Ahmad, et al 2013).

3.3. Incompetent Bureaucratic Structure

Habib, (2013) narrates that the ineffective bureaucratic structure across strong professional information, the main issue of deployment of educational policies will remain unsolved in spite of positive disposition, resources and clear communication. It is also argued that fragmentation lead to hindrance of effective collaboration that is vital for deployment of policies as it might lead to misuse of resources, obstruct the smooth change pace and overlook the few important actions vital for implementation of policies. In viewpoint of Khoja-Moolji (2014) few chronic elements can obstruct the effective implementation of policies in Pakistan that are not related to execution rather they are related to policy maker and overall atmosphere when policies can be developed and executed in effective manner.

3.4. Lacking of Political Will & Leadership Vacuum

The political will of policy implementer has a pivot role in effectual process of implementation. In Pakistan the less contribution of domestic implementer for example principle of school, students and teachers that leads to weakening of policies ownership factor. According to Khan, (2016), implementation success of educational policies is mainly relied on will of policy implementer and developers. The successful deployment of policies, strategic planning, powerful will, well trained teachers, support of community, visionary leadership, resources availability and motivation of teachers has significant role in cementing forces. Asrar-ul-Haq, (2015) suggested that local stakeholder empowerment, strategic planning, political will, mobilization and utilization of resources, monitoring as well as evaluation of educational system are vital for effective deployment.

3.5. Entrenched Corruption

According to Mueller, Gray, & Kosice, (2014) the effective deployment of any policies depends on sacrifice of interest of individual for interest of educational system and overall welfare of society. The attitudes lead to development of atmosphere of transparency and trust. However, since its inception the educational system of Pakistan is confronted with evil entrenchment of corruption that is deeply penetrated in foundation of overall educational system in Pakistan.

3.6. Poverty Issues:

The causes of poverty have vital impact on children abilities to obtain information. The poor family children are at nuisance position due to environment of home and unfriendly family attitude towards education. Moreover, their body resistance is comparatively lower as compared to children belongs to rich families. For these children the poor families are more prone to suffer from illness for example cold, flu, and headache and fatigue that restraint the abilities of children to concentrate on education and lead to reduction in drop out ratio of Pakistan (Haidar, 2017).

3.7. Trend of Private Institutions

The enrolment of private sector in primary sector school is projected to be about 40%. Because of deficiencies in public primary school also majority of them are nonfunctional owing to shortage in primary school teachers, inadequate funds for operational expenses at school and other factors. Hence, parents are reinforced to send their children to private schools that provide comparatively better education. Due to technical collaboration of private sector, the Pakistani government has initiated the partnership based public- private programs. However, because of piecemeal attempt, not much has been achieved so far (Alasuutari, & Qadir, 2013).

4. Conclusion

The review and critical analysis of history of educational policies of Pakistan entail that establishing, the targets, bewailing the achievement of existing and new goals with unqualified optimism lead to ongoing policy maker at greater expense of public in last fifty years. The differences of shades and hues of miscellaneous government either it is military or civilian, Islamic or socialist has made fewer differences to manner by which educational policies are formulated and entail an explicit lacking of political devotion towards education or literacy.

The required reforms require the efforts of government as well as contribution of public private sector and adequate mixture of formal and informal education. In the same manner, a high attention should be given to technical and vocational training. The analysis concludes that strategies are vital for effective policy implementation. The strategies are helpful for establishing the mechanism for the achievement of prescribed aim and objectives. The paper aimed to explore the obstruction in the manner for successful implementation of education al policies in Pakistan. The critical analysis of educational policies of Pakistan entail that there is lack of consistency, lack of direction, ineffective community-institution relation, absence of visionary leadership, corruption on lower level and devotion on behalf of formulator of policies and executor of polices on educational sector of Pakistan. Another reason for policies failure is that there is no mechanism of follow up, accountability for supervisors and authority and lack of training system for implementer and formulator of policies.

5. Recommendations

Following recommendations are made to improve the educational system of Pakistan.

- The responsibilities and roles of federal education ministry and sub national government are required to be agreed upon an effective national mechanism. The roles are required to be reflected in two tiers, a mechanism for inter provincial regarding the policy of broader national issue of education and other is the introduction of regulatory mechanism for the standardization of process for the entire mechanism.
- It is advised to provide more financial incentives to students in order to decrease the drop out ratio. To achieve this purpose more funds should be reserved for the growth of overall education sector. An effective monitoring and accountability system is required to minimize the role of corruption, favoritism and nepotism in educational sector of Pakistan.
- Effective planning is required for utilization of financial resources for the prosperity of overall education sector of Pakistan. In addition, the decentralization step can strengthen the delay in adequate deployment of measure on central level. It is also suggested to improve the investment incrementally. It is suggested to

develop a partnership among public and private sector. It can reduce the expenditure of public on entire infrastructure.

Moreover, for future research, following suggestions are made.

- Due to limited resources and time, the critical review of history of educational policies of Pakistan cannot be explained in comprehensive manner. Hence, an effective research design comprises of mix method such as quantitative and qualitative research can be executed in future to further explore the issues in poor implementation of policies in Pakistan.
- This research is based on compilation and analysis of secondary data only, the future author can obtain primary data either by conducting interview or quantitative questionnaire survey from respective target population.

6. References:

- Ahmad, I., Rauf, M., Rashid, A., ur Rehman, S., & Salam, M. (2013). Analysis of the problems of primary education system in Pakistan: Critical review of literature. *Academic Research International*, 4(2), 324.
- Ahmad, I., Said, H., Hussain, A., & Khan, S. (2014). Barriers to co-education in Pakistan and its implications on girl's education: Critical review of literature. *Science International*, 26(1).
- Alasuutari, P., & Qadir, A. (2013). *National policy-making: Domestication of global trends* (Vol. 117). Routledge.
- Alavi, H. (1972). The state in post-colonial societies Pakistan and Bangladesh. *New Left Review*, (74), 59.
- Amjad, R., & Burki, S. J. (Eds.). (2015). Pakistan. Cambridge University Press.
- Asrar-ul-Haq, M. (2015). Human resource development in Pakistan: evolution, trends and challenges. *Human Resource Development International*, 18(1), 97-104.
- Cloughley, B. (2016). A history of the Pakistan army: wars and insurrections. Skyhorse Publishing, Inc.
- Fatima, A., & Nasr, M. (2010). Financial aid as support for student accessibility to higher education in Pakistan. *International Review of Business Research Papers*, 6(3), 205-218.
- Fikree, F. F., & Gray, R. H. (1996). Demographic survey of the level and determinants of perinatal mortality in Karachi, Pakistan. *Paediatric and perinatal epidemiology*, 10(1), 86-96.
- Habib, M. (2013). Education in Pakistan's Punjab: Outcomes and Interventions. *The Lahore Journal of Economics*, 18(special edition), 21.
- Haidar, S. (2017). Access to English in Pakistan: inculcating prestige and leadership through instruction in elite schools. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 1-16.
- Haqqani, H. (2015). Magnificent delusions: Pakistan, the United States, and an epic history of misunderstanding. PublicAffairs.
- Jafarey, S. A., ardee, J. G., & Satterthwaite, A. P. (1968). Use of medical-paramedical personnel and traditiokal midwives in the Pakistan Family Planning program. *Demography*, 5(2), 666-678.

- Khan, A. H., & Mahmood, N. (1997). Education in Pakistan: Fifty Years of Neglect [with Comments]. *The Pakistan development review*, 647-667.
- Khan, S. H. (2016). Productivity Growth and Entrepreneurship in Pakistan: The Role of Public Policy in Promoting Technology Management. *The Lahore Journal of Economics*, 21, 427.
- Khoja-Moolji, S. (2014). Producing neoliberal citizens: Critical reflections on human rights education in Pakistan. *Gender and Education*, 26(2), 103-118.
- Mahboob, A. (2009). English as an Islamic language: A case study of Pakistani English. *World Englishes*, 28(2), 175-189.
- Mahmood, K. (2003). A comparison between needed competencies of academic librarians and LIS curricula in Pakistan. *The electronic library*, 21(2), 99-109.
- Manan, S. A., Dumanig, F. P., & David, M. K. (2015). The English-medium fever in Pakistan: analyzing policy, perceptions and practices through additive bi/multilingual education lens. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 1-17.
- McLaren, P. (2015). Life in schools: An introduction to critical pedagogy in the foundations of education. Routledge.
- Mueller, V., Gray, C., & Kosec, K. (2014). Heat stress increases long-term human migration in rural Pakistan. *Nature climate change*, 4(3), 182-185.
- Niazi, H. K., & Mace, J. (2006). The contribution of the private sector to higher education in Pakistan with particular reference to efficiency and equity. *Bulletin of Education & Research*, 28(2), 17-42.
- Oppenheim, W., & Stambach, A. (2014). Global norm making as lens and mirror: Comparative education and gender mainstreaming in northern Pakistan. *Comparative Education Review*, 58(3), 377-400.
- Papanek, G. F. (1967). *Pakistan's development, social goals and private incentives*. Harvard University Press.
- Rahman, T. (1997). The medium of instruction controversy in Pakistan. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 18(2), 145-154.
- Razzaq, J. (2016). Community-supported models for girls' education in Pakistan: the transformational processes of engagement. *Development in Practice*, 26(6), 750-763.
- Rozi, S., Akhtar, S., Sajid, A., & Khan, J. (2005). Prevalence and factors associated with current smoking among high school adolescents in Karachi, Pakistan. *Southeast Asian journal of tropical medicine and public health*, *36*(2), 498.
- Shamim, F. (2008). Trends, issues and challenges in English language education in Pakistan. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 28(3), 235-249
- Sharma, U., Shaukat, S., & Furlonger, B. (2015). Attitudes and self-efficacy of pre-service teachers towards inclusion in Pakistan. *Journal of Research in Special Educational Needs*, 15(2), 97-105.
- Sheikh, S. S., & Ali, S. A. (2014). Predictors of vaccination card retention in children 12-59 months old in Karachi, Pakistan. *Oman medical journal*, 29(3), 190.
- Singhal, A., Cody, M. J., Rogers, E. M., & Sabido, M. (Eds.). (2003). *Entertainment-education and social change: History, research, and practice*. Routledge.

- Talbani, A. (1996). Pedagogy, power, and discourse: Transformation of Islamic education. *Comparative education review*, 40(1), 66-82.
- Tamim, T. (2014). The politics of languages in education: Issues of access, social participation and inequality in the multilingual context of Pakistan. *British Educational Research Journal*, 40(2), 280-299.
- Uslaner, E. M., & Rothstein, B. (2016). The historical roots of corruption: State building, economic inequality, and mass education. *Comparative Politics*, 48(2), 227-248.
- Usman, S. (2014). Governance and Higher Education in Pakistan: What Roles do Boards of Governors Play in Ensuring the Academic Quality Maintenance in Public Universities versus Private Universities in Pakistan?. *International Journal of Higher Education*, 3(2), p38.
- Warwick, D. P., Reimers, F., & McGinn, N. (1992). The implementation of educational innovations: Lessons from Pakistan. *International journal of educational development*, 12(4), 297-307.
- Zia, R. (2003). Religion and education in Pakistan: an overview. *Prospects*, 33(2), 165-178.



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License