Reflective view on Teaching as a Career: A Case Study

Mariyam Akram & Syeda Salma Hasan Department of Psychology GC University Lahore

The present case study was aimed to explore the prospects of University teaching by an expert teacher and to highlight the importance of reflection on teaching for professional development. A semi-structured in-depth interview of 14 questions was conducted to explore teaching as a career and was analyzed by Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA). Ten superordinate themes were extracted from the data, which included selecting of teaching as a career, teaching profession now a days, students needs, journey as a teacher, need for discipline, key features of teaching, sources and resources of professional development, weaknesses in Pakistani university teaching, and achievements in teaching career. The results highlighted the changes in teaching career over the period of time from novice to expert. Furthermore, it has also been observed that an expert teacher not only highlights the changes in himself/herself, but also discusses his experience with his students for making him a successful teacher. The gained. This case study indicates that reflection in teaching career plays a vital role in becoming a successful teacher as it keeps you updated about your flaws and strengths.

Keywords: reflective view, teaching, university, career, professional development, journey

One of the most difficult/challenging decisions of young men and women is to select a career as it gives a turning direction to one's life. Teaching is considered as a multiplication of knowledge that a teacher possess and transfers to his students who needs that knowledge to progress in the coming future in specified field. According to O'Donnell, Reeve, and Smith (2012), teaching is an interpersonal struggle of an individual to help others in acquiring knowledge, developing skills, and recognize their capabilities. Ofsted (2004), in his article 'Why Colleges Succeed' depicted that self-critical reflection on teaching practices is the distinct feature of good teachers. According to Scales (2008), successful teaching always requires to challenge and reflect and review our present practices, as trends and needs of students.

Many models have been evolved out of the rigorous work done by the western authors on the gradual development in teaching as a career. The model developed by Reynold's (1965) gives a better understanding about how teaching career starts with early fears of lesson and being heard, which eventually leads to expertise of the teacher in his/her field. A theoretical model of student-teacher model was generated by Kagan (1992) claiming that they enter the institution with the mental imagery about environment, students and imagine himself as teacher. She also highlighted that initially the focus of teachers is on oneself and then eventually build and rebuild one's image as a teacher by enhancing skills in problem solving and interaction with various people at workplace. Furthermore, some researches indicated that teachers go through a gradual change throughout the years and their thinking changes from the rigid beliefs to flexible thinking about educational system and issues.

A work by Berliner (2001) also outlines the development of teacher from novice to expert, but it also highlights that the expertise comes from reflection on one's own methodology. Berliner's model embody the cognitive information-processing view of teachers, as he underscored the teachers' development from

learner/novice to expert by focusing on teachers' understanding of academic outlooks, abilities and thinking patterns. This model has empirical value for educating and evaluating the teachers' expertise development as according to this model teachers change every passing year and eventually gain expertise in his/her field. Furthermore, Huberman (1989) presented a life-long model of teachers which explains the overall career development of teachers as a heuristic for better understanding of the impact of psychological and social factors on teachers life cycle. He described possible stages of teacher's professional life cycle and discussed the focus of teachers in different stages of their career from survival (1-3 years) to stabilization stage which lasts from 4-6 years of teaching for professional commitment. After 6 years of teaching experience if the teacher chooses to experiment in ones career (7-18 years of experience) then he/she gains serenity (by 30 years experience). But if the teacher chooses to be interrogative between his 7-18 years of teaching experience, he would most probably become conservative during his 19-31 years experience. This model also postulates that at times, experimentation leads to conservatism and interrogations of teacher leads to serenity as well. It depends on the experience of teacher in these years, furthermore the model indicates that after the 30 years of teaching experience there are more chances that teacher would become composed or bitter as they withdraw from commitments of profession and gradually internalize things.

There are various theoretical models of teacher's professional development and each model has unique contribution in understanding the teaching process, but the strategic plan for indigenous professional development of teachers cannot be effective enough by any one model. As Bell and Gilbert (1994) viewed teachers' professional development as the learning of teachers about their beliefs, classroom practices and recognizing their sentiments about the changes that come in their way. They also highlighted that the professional development has majorly three types of development namely personal, social and professional and these developments are interlinked with each other. They considered implementation of new theoretical ideas and evaluation of these methods to an extended period of time in collaborative setting to get critical feedback and it also plays an important role in teacher development.

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Mariyam Akram, PhD Scholar, Department of Psychology, Government College University Lahore (Pakistan), Email: mary.ravian@gmail.com

Rationale of the study

Expert teachers reflect on their profession periodically and find contrast between their and novice teachers teaching methodology. As it has been observed through literature review that teacher uses diverse teaching style to impart theoretical and practical implication of the knowledge. Moreover, they impart moral values other than designed curriculum and develop a successful bond between students and teachers. So after a thorough review of literature, it was concluded that there is a need to investigate reflection on teaching by capturing life-time experiences of expert/senior university teachers, so that novices can learn from their experiences. Every culture has its unique values and higher education commission (HEC) also define different role of teachers in Pakistan so there is a need to explore the teaching experience of senior teachers, who work as a role model for novices. This case study can help in how to tread on a path of teaching as a career and flourish as a professional.

Objectives of the study

After reviewing the previous researches, the objectives of the present study are

- To explore career of university teaching by analyzing the case study of an experienced teacher
- To understand the importance of reflection in the teaching career

Research Questions

- How an experienced university teacher with diverse experience reflects on his teaching career?
- Does reflection on teaching effect the professional development of a teacher?

Sample

An inclusive criterion of the sample was the vast and diverse experience in the field of teaching and he opted teaching profession as a choice. Mr X was a male in late adulthood, working as a Professor and Chairman at foreign university. After his Masters from Pakistan he went to US for his PhD. He had a teaching experience of national and international colleges and universities and at the time of interview he was teaching in Pakistani University.

Table 1

Phenomenology of Reflection on Teaching

Instrument

Initially an interview protocol was developed by reviewing previous literature and theoretical frameworks on professional development of teachers. The semi-structured interview consisted of 14 questions. The major question asked was how teachers develop in the teaching career and does reflection on their teaching have any effect on their professional development. Some of the questions of the semi-structured interview were as follows: How is it to be a teacher? What do you think, to what extent your teaching methodology has changed since you have joined this profession? Do you think that teachers can experience stagnation in their profession and why? In your opinion, who is a great teacher? What you have earned in this profession so far? What do you think, what are your contributions as a teacher?

Procedure

First of all the permission was taken from the competent authority and then the interviewee was contacted through the personal contact. The interviewee was first assured about the confidentiality of the information to be obtained by the in-depth interview. The one-to-one interview was taken in the noise free environment in the office of the Chair of a Public University, Lahore. The duration of interview was one and a half hour and the interview was audio recorded. Then the recording was transcribed for the data analysis.

Data analysis

Interpretative Phenomenology Analysis (IPA) was used to derive subordinate and super-ordinate themes from the data. After themes derivation, a phenomenology of reflection on teaching was developed. IPA was most suitable technique for data analysis as professor shared his subjective experience regarding his profession which he had for his whole life and made his career.

Results

The main purpose of the case study was to reflect on the teaching as a career of a professor with diverse exposure and experience. Ten superordinate themes were extracted from the data which presented the "phenomenology of reflection on teaching" as presented in the table 1.

Sr #	Coding initial themes	Subordinate theme	Super-ordinate theme
1	1. I can just be a teacher, I am in this profession by choice, Almighty made this choice for me it was the sole direction for me, I could not help it, I kept on doing what fate destined for me	1. Chosen by Almighty	Teaching selected as a career
	2. I might have become good counselor but I am good in communication skills	2. Good communication skills	
	3. When I started teaching, I was fond of sharing my understanding with others to see, if they understand the same way or not	3. Enjoy knowledge sharing	
	4. When I was in Masters I taught my class for 3 days and they praised me for my capability for knowledge transference	4. Aptitude for teaching	
	5. In my student life I taught in two renowned universities and realized that I have ability to teach I like to understand things myself	5. In depth urge for professional knowledge	

f practical injustice			
ology driven	Teaching		
nesty in terms of edge transfer	profession now a days		
nesty in terms of time aints			
e needs scaffolding			
e needs less guidance			
ity of knowledge	Student needs		
ity of information			
motivated for the of information ork	Journey as a teacher		
o discussion			
xplanatory teaching			
learner is needed			
ness of applied ons			
l and research based			

and then I present it in front of other people and then see how they react.... It is fascinating... that is why I can't do anything else.... 6. My father used to believe in me that I can be a good counselor but 6. Fear of I had a fear that I might harm someone..... 1. Time has changed a lot, teachers are technology driven and they 1. Techno are asked to use technology..... Teachers study a lot now, they have a lot of information in hand... 2. Dishor 2. they are doing a great job... getting greedy for knowledge but they are knowle unable to convey all the knowledge to the students in the class..... Teachers have so much knowledge nowadays but due to time 3. 3 Dishor constraint they are unable to convey it to the students which is dishonesty constra with oneself and students..... teachers study 4 chapter for the lecture and they are unable to convey those chapters to the student in 1.5 hours.... This is an unfair process..... 4. It is difficult teach few things to the junior students.... as courses are new to introductory students so you have to give them guideline on 4. Novice every step.... I can't teach introductory students as it requires alot of patience which I don't have.... 5. I like to teach senior classes.... As they have a base of subject I Mature just need to give them a hint and they pick it up and understand it themselves and critically evaluate it with reference to different phenomenon.... 1. There is a difference in students now and in the past.... students 1. Quanti now a days wants to know everything about the topic under consideration.... In old times, students used to think like a philosopher in the class but now they emphasize more on the quantity of the information In old times there was emphasis on the quality of information but 2. 2. Divers now students emphasize more on the quantity of the information.... They want to know from where they can get maximum information and what the sources are and which type of resources can be used.... I believe those students who want to excel in the field should have 3. 3. Less command on both quantitative and qualitative approaches..... quality When I started my career I was very hardworking and I used to 1. 1. Hardw spend a lot of time with my books in the office as well as at home.... My wife was so supportive that she never complaint that I don't give her time.... 2. In my career, if I see in my teaching the biggest change is that my 2. Book t teaching switched from line-to-line book reading to discussion based class room... where I teach and learn at the same time from the audience..... 3. In the initial phase of my career, I realized that I am not teaching students but I am teaching myself and I used to think that those who 3. Self-ex are sitting in the class are sitting aimlessly and they are thinking that professor came in the class and said something..... now I believe that I am better than when I started this career.... 4. I used to have active and passive learners in the class but never 4. Active used to give time or chance to them to speak out.... Now I am more open to students, I smile frequently in the class and give them more chances to think and question..... 5. Now I am more aware of applied questions of the students... now 5. Aware when I prepare lecture I think when I will convey this information to my questio students in the class which type of response I would get.... and I prepare myself accordingly.... Normally in my class, I try my level best to make students think 6. Factua 6 out of the box and make them think in broader way.... Like I tell them teaching studies define the X concept like this, but some clever person defined the concept of X in totally different manner... I asked my class then that the thing we believe in is totally different in the explanation of the clever person, what you think?.... like there is a catchy line of love, "opposite attracts", but after few months they start having clashes and then divorce.... When I discuss this in the class and says that studies used to talk about this phase differently, what do you think?.... I challenge the

2

3

thoughts of my students in the class based on facts and previous researches....

7. In the initial years of my teaching, I used to get offended by the little acts of my students, like delays in assignments, bad grades, lack of answering capability in the class were highly disliked by me, but now with the passage of time I have learnt to know about the problems of my students... delays in assignments and projects does not matter me unless and until they affect my class discipline....

8. In the initial phase of my teaching career I used to prepare my lecture thoroughly, because I used to fear what if I impart incomplete information to my students... did students understand what I taught them? I used to prepare my lecture so well...

cl

1. A set of disciplinary protocols is important in the class otherwise class would not be successful in knowledge transfer.... classes are of different types but every class requires discipline.....

2. Other discipline is the one where you expect students to ask question but not that 3 students would ask question at one time as it create trouble in the class. So to promote education we need to have disciplined classes, where we do activity, and not sit in class without clothes, general respect of teachers and students, as it is part of discipline....

3. In contrast, if there is a class of philosophy... teacher take his/her teaching into abstraction....and gives the conceptual idea to students so that they can think and evaluate things on their own.... Every subject have its demands, but if the discipline in the class is maintained then conceptual and practical understanding become easy.

4. There is different type of classes, like theoretical, conceptual or practical... but discipline is important.... Like for practical understanding of things teacher should have discipline accordingly otherwise most of the people would be left behind.... Practical class if would be haphazard things would be messy....

5. Strictly disciplined classrooms possess fear that teacher is talking keep quiet and write notes, and ask classfellow to get the notes copied after the class....and highlight the notes in the class.... but it is generating fear, timidity, and shyness....

6. If there would be rowdiness in the class how would we educate students, we cannot give any conceptual understanding to such class... we cannot facilitate accordingly.....

1. If a person has some personal concerns and is thoughtful about it all the time during lecture, then what would he retain.... So, the most important thing is to grab the attention of students by your knowledge and words...procedure is same, but now we are technology oriented....rather we talk about conceptual thing but we show the slide and ask about physical expression of things.... We should raise questions and make them curious to get the answer to the question by their own thinking and assessment...

2. Teaching methodology has not changed as their work is to deliver lecture in the class... to deliver lectures, as bandura says, two factors are important: attention and retention.... If you want your students to retain information that you give in the class, then attentive towards what you say is important. Its been so long attention and retention are important....

3. Now two more factors are important motivation and individual differences.... Initially we used to put up the question but now we bring with us the references with technology, and we don't wait our students to go home and think about... we make them think during the class.

4. If a person has some personal concerns and is thoughtful about it all the time during lecture, then what would he retain.... So, the most important thing is to grab the attention of students by your knowledge and words...procedure is same, but now we are technology oriented....rather we talk about conceptual thing but we show the slide and ask about physical expression of things.... We should raise questions and make them curious to get the answer to the question by their own thinking and

7. Patience in teaching 8. Professional expertise with time 1. Ease of knowledge transfer Need of discipline 2. Mannerism 3. Active interactive and learning 4. Enhance practical knowledge 5. Fear of teacher 6. Conceptual knowledge Key features of 1. Attention teaching 2. Retention 3. Motivation

4. Individual difference

5

of

	 assessment 5. Every class is discussion oriented One of the important thing is can students imitate their teachers? If teachers have a power to grab your attention then you would understand the contentsocrates believed that good teachers are those who produce same capabilities in their students through imitation To impress someone is difficult and someone would imitate you if you would have any such thingTeachers and spiritual leaders impress others and give them gifts like smile and respect Style of teaching did not change but different teachers have come in the field 6. Yes I reflect on my teaching all the time What a blunder I have made. I should have taught this course or topic other way or at times we tell a wrong thing mistakenly and next day apologize and correct it It's part of my regular teaching 7. To promote education we need to have disciplined classes, where 	6. R	nitation deflection Discipline	
7	we do activity, and general respect of teachers and students is part of discipline But if there would be rowdiness in the class how would we educate students, we cannot give any conceptual understanding to such class we cannot facilitate accordingly 1-4. There are so many things that enhances one's knowledge like books, observation, reflection, exchanging, experimentation There are	1. 2.	Books Observations	Sources knowledge
	three or four dimensions by which you learn as individual differences exist5. Every class is discussion oriented Important thing is can students	3. 4.	Reflection Experimentation	Ū.
	imitate their teachers if the teacher has power to grab your attention then you would understand the contentSocrates believed that good teachers are those who produce same capabilities in their students through imitation To impress someone is difficult and someone would imitate	5.	Interaction with students and faculty/reciprocity	
	you if you would have any such thing 6. Foreign exposure does not always mean to go in west but to meet new culture with one's knowledge can be priceless experience Because we keep on learning	6.	Foreign visits	
	7. Paper publication is your output Input is important for professional development Reflection, experimentation, exchange of discussion is input But presenting paper, delivering lecture, reading, are outputs.	7. P	ublications	
	8. It feels great to see the work of Pakistani people in international conferences People get trained as well as train others there	8.	Trainings	
	9. Attending the workshops (international and national) widen the knowledge of attendees and it widens their horizons of knowledge10. Getting in touch with readings also widen the knowledge of scholars	9. 10.	Workshops Readings	
	as it is not always possible for us to visit the other countries to get in touch with information they have new in their fields	11	Student multisticus	
	11. I learn a lot from student's evaluation But I respect students who give narrative evaluation Like if they talk about my teaching though it's good or bad and then be blunt about what they think about metell about my class attitude, class management, etc	11.	Student evaluations	
	 Paper publication is like a fair exchange you give your point of view to the people around in the same field and your standing become strong Stargetion keeps on hermoning — Many times — Lean reflect on 		Paper presentation at conference as a fair exchange Stagnation leading	
	13. Stagnation keeps on happening Many timesI can reflect on many semesters when I was not actual teacher and I dint enjoy teaching there came times when I was just taking class but was unable to give my 100%it is like a cliff hanging when you start going up initially you are very enthusiastic and you enjoy cliff hanging, but then at one point you are tired you sit for a while pass your time and then start again	15.	Stagnation leading progress	
	with full motivation every person face that time of energy and stagnation Religious scholars also talk about this this is an healthy process but you are going up sternly but at times, break takes place like a class is based on people whose major is not psychology, or they came to pass time, They don't have interest they say what to			
	memorize I avoid taking such junior classes, and asking the juniors to teach such classes			

14. But professional development is when you want to be skillful in some specific thing And want to study For that every experience is important that make you progress in the relevant fieldit is like a plant When plants grow into tree it always need water sunlight fertile soil to become a healthy tree If all things are present it is fruitful tree And which does not get all these factors It remains small and the fruit is tasteless	14. Curiosity for knowledge		
1. Rote memorization also takes place in foreign countries they also memorize the definitions As far as rote memorization is concerned, the students here are better because they pay more attention on this students are weak in rote learning there The only difference is that they have many examples to see the possibility but it could not be inculcated in our genre unfortunately	1. Rote learning	Weaknesses Pakistani university teaching	of
2. Individual differences exist But here it is difficulty people are not given freedom But boys and girls work here and express themselvesto create independence	2. No freedom to express oneself		
3. Individual differences exist Same is the case with west but the only difference is to inculcate curiosity people are given openness and opportunities to work and spell out things openly	3. Lack of curiosity		
4. To structure and organize the researches of Pakistan that take place here when they would be structured then automatically the examples of Pakistan would be used in classes and discussions when indigenous base would broaden it will become productive We are just laid back	4. Lack of indigenous literature		
5. An experienced teacher have years of experience and they answer the class questions on the spot but the novice teacher asks a time to first an answer and come back to the student furtherwith a passage of time and experience things change	5. Need for personal and professional development		
6. Experimentation leads to generation of indigenous knowledge This is needed to generate the Pakistani literature	6. Experimentation is needed		
1. Professional development is when you want to be skillful in some specific thing And want to study For that every experience is important that make you progress in the relevant fieldit is like a plant When a plant grows into tree it always need water sunlight fertile soil to become a healthy tree If all things are present it is fruitful tree And which does not get all these factors It remain small and the fruit is tasteless	1. Skill learning	Resources professional development	of
2. In my initial teaching career, I used to dig myself in books for hours to get up-to-date information and it has actually upgraded me and proved to an essential source of development	2. Up-to-date information		
3. Obviously professional development takes place by reflection One professional development is upgradation or promotion It is useless	3. Upgradation		
4. Student's evaluation possesses positive and negative comments i.e., my student narrates that I just give attention to those students who are good in studies And they are neglected This is something to worry about and next day when I go to the class I pay more attention to people I don't reflect more on before	4. Acceptance of negative comments		
5. If cross cultural exposure does not take place physically, then a person can educate oneself by books and see what people do in which countries and how things go on in the world At least one should make an effort	5. Knowledge exchange		
6. Obviously I m outgroup I am not US nativebut by the grace of ALLAH I have an ability to be accepted by the people of outgroup as I am very social person I am easy to go person I can mix in any genre as human nature is same but I don't think there would be any difficulty in understanding things and people And now they understand the value of western and eastern culture They (Pakistani scholars) are working so well People of Pakistan are doing tremendous work there are so many peopleI give many examples of east in my classI teach muslim philosophers	6. Eastern culture intellectual growth		
7. With a passage of time and opportunities I think I am more	7. Opportunities for		

flexible And there is variety of opportunities given by HEC and	professional	
institutions to upgrade their teaching staff	development for novices	
1. I used to stare before why you did not do the work but now I	1. Flexibility with experience	Achievements in
am ok with this and now I feel that may be I am unable to understand the		teaching career
perspective of my students the thing student is saying is quite foolish		
but from other perspective may be it is not that odd He is trying to		
explain his problemhe is asking for answer It is my duty to answer	2 Description and laser has	
the student, but if he is asking for wrong thing then I should tell him how	2. Respect and love by	
he can correctly ask that question	students	
2. There are so many things that I have earned from the teaching		
profession some of them are:		
• Love and respect from students and faculty members		
• Erased the difficulties of my students, and when they		
apply it in their practical life they call back or email What you		
taught us is so clear that now we ca differentiate in things well we		
can tell people about life satisfaction		
• Chair of the department by the grace of Allah		
• I can teach in both continents		
• Earned subject	2 Farmed knowledge	
3. In my opinion, great teacher is the one who pour his whole	3. Earned knowledge	
knowledge in jug of drink and give it to his 10 students and say drink it		
their knowledge and student's knowledge is equal he is the GREATEST		
teacher	1 Students prograss	
4. Some students you can convince, but some are very helpless	4. Students progress	
Few kick in and few remain adamant but some go greatone of the		
student I used to challenge He was not interested initially and used to		
fail mostly but then I started challenging him in the class, and now he is		
doing PhD in psychology he recently came to meet me and said if you		
and another teacher would not have come in my life I would have been		
doing some small task I would have left the university But now he		
is satisfied with his life he said you changed my life there are so		
many examples in my careerThat makes me satisfied with my life	5. Love for wisdom	
5. I had a love for wisdom but I think that I did not contribute much	5. Love for wisdom	
in the field because my emphasis was on teaching psychology if I		
would get chance further then I would endeavor may be I would not		
teach then but would do field work and work for empirical data With		
family and other responsibilities that devotion for field work is not		
possible it becomes very difficult, the way I want to read and		
understand things I don't get time for it I say to my colleagues that my		
bedroom should be above my office And I freely roam around and		
work in my lab That's it right now my emphasis is on teaching, but the function of things and exploring things		
the fun is in opening things and exploring things		
6. Race of qualification exists a lot if you would publish papers only then you would be alive otherwise you would	6. Life-long process of	
only then you would be alive otherwise you would die(professionally) It's everywhere like in USA, France, UK,	learning	
India but this is not the aim of teaching but like 'philosophy' means the	C	
'love for wisdom', that if you indulge someone in the love for wisdom		
then you have done your jobevery person learns till death teaching		
and learning process never ends and it would never end if you burn that		
light in anyone to seek for knowledge then work is doneFrom very first		
day since I am studying experimentation is interestingI don't know		
life took me to teaching, but in actually I moved to do that but it needs		
devotion and time limits should not be thereThe major priority for me in		

- whole career was.... Personal satisfaction was more important, 1.
 - imparting knowledge in others,
 - 2. 3. professional development,

10

> 4. Giving professional development to others....

Discussion

The present case came up with ten super-ordinate themes which explain the teaching career of Mr X who devoted his whole life in this profession and seems to be happy about his career. For him, reflection on his career resulted in his view regarding a struggle to be a good teacher since he first taught the classes in his student life on the behalf of his own teacher's recommendations.

In the initial phase of his reflection on teaching as a career, he discussed the reasons for selecting it as a career and he told that he had an aptitude of teaching as he had good communication skills and he had an urge for professional knowledge. Furthermore, he emphasized that it was a profession of prophets as they used to preach and teach which multiplied their teaching among the people. As cited by Azram (2016), Imam Al-Ghazzali wrote that Prophet (PBUH) said "like a father I want to save my child from the hell" means accepting the child/student as one's own unconditionally which is the primary duty of a teacher. In addition, the career development training by Further Education and Training (2013) claims that careers are not selected but are built throughout life by our choices of learning and work as career is subjective choice. Apart from taking teaching positively as a career, Greenhaus (2003), in his contrary study, describes that individuals also shift from one profession to another like teaching to public relations and pursue different jobs as managing the career is subjective and it's constantly changing.

The second major theme of the case was "Teaching profession now a day", it was extracted from his point of view regarding the changes that he have seen in the teaching presently as he compared it with his past experience. He told that "teaching in past time was quite different in his initial phase of career as it was not equipped with technology but now technology has taken the burden of teacher's memory and it facilitates in teaching the material in more advanced and meaningful manner". This was supported by Costley (2014) who claimed that the use of technology can alter classroom environment into an interactive one as Bulut and Delen (2011) proved that use of information technology in classroom positively effects the teacher instructions which enhance students learning. Mr X also reported that "teachers now days are not as honest as they were in reference to time and transfer of knowledge because teachers have approach to a lot of information but they lack time to transfer it to students". This factor was also discussed in the study by Johri (2006) as every student is different from the other one on the basis of intelligence, knowledge adaptation and absorption of the knowledge being delivered in the class. The participant pointed out that in the present scenario teachers have great deal of knowledge due to maximum approach to available material online and in hand but they are unable to convey that much knowledge in the provided time which is insufficient. Similarly, Zheng (2015) emphasized that tension in teacher and student centeredness is reinforced by time constraint that teachers face in completing the curriculum. In addition, Woolfolk, Misra, and Jha (2012) proposed that classrooms are multidimensional as they are composed of diverse people, time pressure to fulfill task with limited resources and hundreds of exchange that takes place during teacher-student interaction in a classroom. Furthermore, the subject also shared his view that novice students need a lot of guidance in organizing knowledge that is why it is hard to teach them as being an experienced teacher our temperaments does not match. He also reported that "teaching a mature student (higher education) is in my comfort zone as we understand each other's point of view and share

few concepts in a same way, and even if we don't agree on any point or concept we have healthy discussions which groom us both".

After emphasizing on the teaching in present scenario, participant discussed the "needs of the students" which are changing with the changing time and modes of information. It has been observed by the participant that presently students don't think like philosophers but they think about the importance of the information in reference to its use in longer run and how much information they can get in lesser time. This view of the participant was also supported by Jackson (2009) as he claimed that teachers and students should focus on the quality of knowledge that teacher give and student take, as it takes them to new horizons. He also declared that "students also go for short cuts now, meaning they want to know the maximum information in the least time by using different resources, but they don't aim to learn from it mostly, as they want to win the examinations and secure the future jobs for them". Being an expert professor with diverse experience the subject has seen less motivation in students for the quality of information as they just move in one direction that is marks. Brookhart (2009) and Docan (2006) worked on effects of marks on students and concluded that marks are source of influence for the student which enhances his interest in subject matter, future performance and motivation to study. Furthermore, a research by O'Donnell, Reeve and Smith (2012) proposed that it is a major task of the teachers to bring students to the curriculum through innovative interventions.

When the participant was asked about his "journey as a teacher" from novice to expert, he highlighted few milestones of his career development. He told that "when I started teaching as a profession, I used to work really hard as used to surround myself with the books and paid more attention to my teaching tasks then personal life". Shamatov (2005) also concluded that in the 1st year of teaching profession a teacher faces 'reality shock' about teaching as it is a demanding job and these demands and problems vary from person to person and place to place. Similar, as he shared that in initial phase of his teaching he used to focus more on what is written in the books rather what his students understood out of it as he wanted his students to learn everything written in their books just like him. But with a passage of time he realized that his students need to be heard, and they should be given a chance to ask questions out of curiosity and this realization changed his mode of teaching. Kyriacou (1986) work supports the participant's claims as effective teaching is done by giving desired learning to student's by different educational activities as teachers' professional development depends on their thinking patterns regarding their profession. Participant also told that" in the start years of my career, I used to read books most of the time to teach myself and groom oneself from novice to expert teacher". He also believed that it was needed as in those times there were no such training programs to make good teachers. Similar point of view was displayed by Ericsson, Krampe and Tesch-Romer (1993) as their research came up with the results that expertise come with a room of improvement in the teacher, but if he thinks that change is not needed in him, he would always remain novice. While thinking about initial phase of his career he pointed out that he used to have active and passive learners in his class but he never gave them time to put up their queries but now he has changed as he give them time to think and question. Similar are the results of O'Donnell, Reeve and Smith (2012) as they emphasized that the outstanding teaching is a combination of teacher expertise, students learn ability, acceptance of diversity in the class, multiple skills of teachers along

with great hard work. He also compared his lecture preparation difference then and now, as initially he used to prepare what students should know and now he prepares his lecture by thinking how well they would know as he keep house open for the questions and prepare himself accordingly. It was similar to Strahan (1990) work which stressed that novice teachers confirm themselves in playing role of teacher and focuses on student's appraisal about their performance as well as validate their success as teacher by students' academic performance. He also emphasized on his personal grooming in these years as it has made him patient and research based teacher as he can now understand his students better and keep on challenging their knowledge. His personal and professional growth and understanding of student's problem can be supported and proved correct by the Huberman Model of Professional development (1989). Mr X also told that " professionally I became a good teacher as initially I used to think that my students should understand a thing in a complete manner but now I also ask myself a question, "how" and "what" my students should know and it has given me a path to follow in my career". The model of teacher expertise by Berliner (2001) discussed the journey of teacher from learner to expert and in the fifth and last stage of "expert teacher" he concluded that teachers foresee lesson and they are flexible leaders who are skilful in administrative tasks. He also stressed that no one is expert in one's field since start but it takes alot of effort, years of experience and motivation to get refined and take a top position which was extensively studied by Murray (1992). Murray (1992) found out that when someone enters in teaching profession he/she learns to socialize professionally by their elevated problem solving capability, interpersonal skills and critical thinking. The journey of Mr X can be represented by the Huberman model as the subject claimed that in the initial years of his teaching career he used to dig in himself in books to seek more knowledge for his survival which stabilized him as teacher and gave him popularity. Then eventually he started experimenting with his knowledge and switched to abroad for professional growth and experienced serenity after the achievements in his career which gave him the feeling of accomplishment. Mr X also showed commitment to his professional values after 30 years experience but due to his philosophical and adventurous nature he did not reach the level of disengagement as claimed by Huberman. However, he tries to lessen the generation gap between him and his students by giving them space to grow.

Then eventually, he discussed about the "need of discipline" in the teaching territory as it is important to have disciplinary rules for better impartment of knowledge. He highlighted that "presently students gain quantity of information rather than quality of information because teachers have to complete the already set curriculum in limited time span". This point of view of the participant can be better explained by Johri (2006) work claimed that learning environment also plays a crucial role in the learning ability of students as student-teacher interaction, student-student interaction, room environment and subject matter; everything is interrelated and has impact on each other. He also believed that "mannerism and active/interactive learning are facilitated in disciplined classroom" as Elias and Schwab (2006) claimed that behaviour of student is the problem but not student himself and managed classroom enhances socio-emotional development of a student. Furthermore, Mr X also highlighted that disciplined classroom enhances the chance of practical knowledge of students which was also a belief of Doyle (2006) that students cooperation in classroom activities is essential ingredient for harmonious and

ordered classroom which facilitates learning. It has also been observed by the professor that disciplined class enhances practical knowledge of the students, which was also observed by Emmer and Gerwels (2006) that teacher have to engage the students to maintain good learning environment in the class as students learn more through interaction in challenging way. In addition, Professor shared many experiences of his career that depicted that being a teacher means being patient enough as students keep on challenging your patience through their non serious attitudes as proved by Kathpalia and Ling (2007). He also shared an interesting fact that normally students are scared of teachers by their knowledge or personality but it have great impact on students, which was also highlighted by the Gomes and Mendes (2007) who argued that negativity towards subject is linked with instable or negative feelings/fear of teacher.

While giving an interview, Mr X also highlighted the "Key features of teaching" that are essential in teachers to have a good rapport with students. He claimed that "for me keeping students attentive in the class, making them retain the information by giving real life/interesting examples as well motivating students to participate in the class are important features of the successful teacher". To make class more interactive and making teaching more efficient various models have been developed to guide teachers about making classrooms interactive as researched on college students have revealed that students involvement in classroom teaching ensures learning and optimize their learning capacities (McGill & Brockband, 2004). Professor X also talked about the importance of individual difference that persists in class as every class includes diversity and different researches showed that unbiased, caring and cooperative teacher respects diversity and seems to have command on his subject (Bartholomew, 2008; Woolfolk-Hoy & Weinstein, 2006). He also claimed that the good teacher grabs the attention of his students and impress them with their knowledge and unconsciously students start imitating them, as student is central in teaching-learning process and they adapt and absorb the knowledge (Johri, 2006). In addition, he also shared his experience that reflection on his class lecture before, during and after the class made him grows as a better teacher which was better expanded in Clark and Peterson (1986) phases of cognitive processes.

When Mr X was asked about the sources of professional development and knowledge for one self and students he pointed out books, observations, experimentation, work in collaboration foreign visits and transfer of knowledge among teachers and students. Different sources of professional development have been taken in spotlight by the variety of researchers, including on-going training and mentoring approach (Kruse & Luis, 1997), team teaching, peer coaching, reflective discussion and action (Pounder, 1999), foreign visits, higher education, engagement in research projects and research publications. These sources of knowledge were evaluated in different studies in reference to professional development as Bredeson (2002) claimed professional development of teachers as a learning opportunity to employ creativity and reflective capacities of educators to strengthen their professional capacities. Furthermore, he expressed that knowledge exchange through research, books and articles also facilitates teacher's professional development as research reveals that the beliefs and ideas of teacher are guided by the instructional experiences and decisions they make (Wilson, Readence, & Konopak, 2002). He also claimed that trainings, workshops, readings and student evaluation are great sources of professional development of the

teacher as these sources involve development of knowledge and skills, and also alter the perspectives of trainees while training session (Cochran-Smith & Lytle, 2001). But over the period of time, it has been seen that workshop-based professional development is ineffective as it does not have follow up of participants and no exposure to actual teaching practices and display no impact on achievement of students (Yoon, Duncan, Lee, Scarloss, & Shapley, 2007) but positive or negative feedback have great impact on construction of knowledge (Kathpalia & Ling, 2007).

While asking about teaching experience, Mr X presented with few "Weaknesses of Pakistani University Teaching" like rote learning which is considered as the worst issue of our teaching system but it has been seen that rote learning is part of almost every educational system as LaGrange College Education Department (2009) believes that knowing the central concept is important for the construction of new concept. But research by Rehman and Khan (2011) also revealed the fact that Pakistani examination system does not evaluate students in all aspect but just test their memory. Furthermore, he also emphasized that people do not have freedom to express their point of views, though that's a teacher or a student. Furthermore, he also compared his experience of teaching in USA and Pakistan and claimed that in Pakistan students are not given freedom of thought whereas American students are asked to explore things to keep up their level of curiosity. Teacher accept the restrictions and laws to survive in the profession (Bell & Robinson, 2004), and students normally want to excel in their field and they believe that excellence comes with high grades as Boud (1988) claimed that assessment have greater impact on what and how student learn and it effects their self-understanding as well. It has also been seen by him that students lack curiosity, because unfortunately they are not given food of thought which might be because of the lack of time to finish the curriculum. The most unfortunate thing is that in Pakistan universities focus more on the quantity of the curriculum, rather quality of the curriculum being taught to the students and curiosity is suppressed in this education system. It has also been observed that rote learning makes students dependent on already set material, and for students better learning capability they should be made curious to process more information (Gardner, 2007). That lack of curiosity might be the reason of lack of literature in different fields of Pakistani culture, as curiosity leads to exploration but now vast variety of research is being conducted in Pakistan which is relevant to problems of education system and its solutions i.e., Ahmad, Rauf, Rashid, Rehman and Salam (2013); Ahmad, Rehman, Ali, Khan and Khan (2014). These researches indicate that in Pakistan restrictions on curriculum, lack of resources for teachers to grow makes this profession difficult but sources like faculty development programs, research grants are emerging solutions for this issue. Furthermore, to grow the educational system of Pakistan experimentation is also needed as every culture have its values which have great impact on the educational institutions, for that sake trial and error is required and research shows the importance of experimentation in application of knowledge (LaGrange College Education Department, 2009). Moreover, while discussing the weaknesses of Pakistani teaching system Mr X focused more on the education system rather comparing his learning systems in two different educational setups. However, he reported that "Pakistan prepared me as a teacher and USA enhanced my teaching and experimentation skills".

After discussing the sources of professional development and weaknesses of Pakistani education system at university level, Mr X

highlighted the resources that can be of help to strengthen one's education system at subjective level. Initially, he highlighted that the skill learning is an important way of professional development, as being a teacher is a life-long learning. As O'Donnell, Reeve, and Smith (2012) stressed that teaching is an interpersonal struggle of an individual to help others in acquiring knowledge, developing skills, and recognize their capabilities. In addition, up-to-date knowledge was given importance as with changing time, theories and models are changing as Jackson (1968) claimed that teaching cannot take place in isolation as teaching involves learning of new skills. Moreover, he also showed a concern that up-gradation or promotion is a source of motivation for a teacher to keep on going in personal and professional growth. Similar to this view the research by Ganser (2000) which emphasizes that teachers achieve their formal and informal professional development when they systematically examine their teaching style and gain experience. It has been few years that professional development of teachers is considered a long-term practice including regular opportunities and experiences to promote growth in profession (Cochran-Smith & Lytle, 2001). Furthermore, through student evaluations teachers' gain acceptance for negative comments which eventually make them grow in their profession. A study by Evans (2002) also highlighted that sometimes the change in teaching attitude and function are visible but if it demotivate the teacher or minimize their productivity it is just a change but not development. It has also been observed that instructional strategies improve when a third person observes the teacher in action and provides feedback on instructional practices (Sparks & Loucks-Horsley, 1989). Furthermore, researches and Mr X also highlighted the availability of the opportunities as important resource of professional development as leg pulling is common in also every profession and normally few people enjoy the opportunities and others envy those people. Furthermore, intellectual growth of eastern culture like indigenous work is also opening horizon for professional development of teachers, similar results were also shown by Young (2001) as it showed that professional development of teachers affect their teaching practice which changes students learning process.

The last super-ordinate theme reflects on the achievements of Mr X as a teacher. Firstly he counted on the flexibility that he encountered in his personality while comparing his initial phase of career with his present attitude towards career problems or changes. Feiman-Nemser (2003) also stressed that expert teachers are flexible and novices should learn this quality in their professional life. Additionally, "the respect and love from students was another life time achievement" for Mr X, similar as Thompson (1998) stressed that teachers most powerful weapon is positive relationship with their students and Kohn (1993) asserted that children respect when they are respected and taken care of. Then he acknowledge the treasure of upto date knowledge that he gained from this profession as to teach he had to know what is going on in the world which made him feel young and in touch with the field. The knowledge gaining process can be best described or linked with the Cochran-Smith and Lytle (2001) three approaches of professional development that co-exists in teaching profession that are knowledge-for-practice (predefined knowledge), knowledge-inpractice (practice embedded knowledge) and knowledge-of-practice (opportunities to gain knowledge). If a teacher wants to excel in his profession then he can follow these three processes to succeed. In addition he talked about the progress and achievements of his students that made him feel proud whenever his students used to tell him that he changed their lives. As he opted teaching as a career by

choice, his aims for his students were different than those who opted as the only option, just like Kettle and Sellars (1996) claimed that teachers professional preparation affects the outcomes of teachers' for their students. He also revealed that "I have an innate love for wisdom, although I did not contribute much in my field but tried to give rise to next generation with experimental and experiential interests". His view was similar to Kathpalia and Ling (2007) who claimed that new wave of thinking on educational system is to switch from teacher-dominated patterns to collaborative tasks which would eventually promote sharing of knowledge and raise the rate of learning. While closing the interview, Mr X concluded that "teaching is a life-long process of learning as it is a give and take of knowledge". Whereas, Day (1999) represents teachers professional development as a process where teachers, being a change agent, appraise, recommence and extend their obligation as well as make critical development in their skills, understanding, practice and planning throughout their teaching career.

Conclusion and Implications

To conclude, the reflection of Mr X revealed that 30 years back teaching was opted as a divine profession and it was continued as a career on will but now a day's people don't value the essence of teaching which is making students and other professions think less of this profession. He also revealed that in past times students used to come in the classes for knowledge and they used to think like philosophers, but now unfortunately mostly students come for attendance or grades and they think like mathematician. Along with that he said that "need of discipline is still the same but the change is how we make class disciplined, in initial phase of my career I used to punish them but now I indulge them in a lecture so they learn, retain and maintain discipline at the same time". Furthermore, Mr X also stressed that as he spent his life in a teaching profession to make it his career, it brought many positive personal, social and professional changes in him and he achieved love and respect of people around him, which is hard to get in present scenario. Furthermore, he also discussed that now there are many sources like trainings, workshops, publications, readings, books, foreign visits that give a way to teachers to reach to different resources like knowledge exchange, skill learning, upgradation, intellectual growth and many others. It is concluded that teacher have same spirit, aim, love for wisdom but with time they get mature and experienced in handling the problems inside and outside the class and reflection on one's performance play vital role in it.

Limitations and Suggestions

The limitations of the study are that findings of the study cannot be generalized since it is a case study. Furthermore, this research is based on only on the reflection on teaching as a career by a single experienced professional. To overcome these limitations, quantitative study can be carried out to evaluate reflection in terms of gender and experience of teachers. Moreover, in future grounded theory can b used to develop an indigenous theory on reflective teaching.

References

Ahmad, I., Rauf, M., Rashid, A., Rehman, S., & Salam, M. (2013). Analysis of the problems of primary education system in Pakistan: Critical review of literature. Academic Research International, 4 (2), 324-331.

- Ahmad, I., Rehman, K., Ali, A., Khan, I., & Khan, F. A. (2014). Critical analysis of the problems of education in Pakistan: Possible solutions. *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education (IJERE)*, 3 (2), 79-84.
- Azram, M. (2016). Teacher's qualities, responsibilities and role. *The Dialogue*, 11 (2), 178-187.
- Bartholomew, K. (2008). Review of smart growth and climate change: Regional development, infrastructure and adaptation. *Journal of the American Planning Association*, 74(3), 379.
- Bell, C., & Robinson, N. (2004). The successful student-teaching experience: Thoughts from the ivory tower. *Music Educators Journal*, 91(1), 39–42.
- Berliner, D. (2001). Teacher expertise. In Banks, F. and Mayes, A. S. (Ed.) *Early professional development for teachers*. London: David Fulton Publishers.
- Boud, D. (1988). Moving towards autonomy. In D. Boud (Ed), Developing student autonomy in learning (2nd ed.). London: Kogan Page.
- Bredeson, P. V. (2002). The architecture of professional development: Materials, messages and meaning. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 37 (8), 661-675.
- Brookhart, S. (2009). Grading. Merrill: New York.
- Bulut, O., & Delen, E. (2011). The relationship between students' exposure to technology and their achievement in science and math. *The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 10(3).
- Clark, C., & Peterson, P. (1986). Teachers' thought processes. In M. Wiltrock (Ed.), *Handbook of Research on Teaching* (3rd ed., pp. 255-296). New York: Macmillan.
- Cochran-Smith, M., & Lytle, S. L. (2001). Beyond certainty: Taking an inquiry stance on practice. In Lieberman, A., and Miller, L. (eds.), *Teachers caught in the action: Professional* development that matters. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Costley, K. C. (2014, October 30). The positive effects of technology on teaching and student learning. Retrieved March 13, 2017, from http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED554557.pdf
- Day, C. (Ed.). (1999). Developing teachers: The challenges of lifelong learning. Philadelphia, PA: Psychology Press.
- Docan, T. K. (2006). Positive and negative incentives in the classroom: An analysis of grading systems and student motivation. *Journal of Scholarship of Teaching and Learning*, 6 (2), 21-40.
- Doyle, W. (2006). Ecological approaches to classroom management. In C. Evertson & C. Weinstein (Eds.), *Handbook* of classroom management: Research, practice, and contemporary issues (pp. 97–125). New York: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Elias, M. J., & Schwab, Y. (2006). From compliance to responsibility: Social and emotional learning and classroom management. In C. M. Evertson, & C. S. Weinstein (Eds.), *Handbook of classroom management: Research, practice, and contemporary issues* (pp. 309–341). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Emmer, E.T., & Gerwels, M.C. (2006). Classroom management in the middle and High school classrooms. In C. M. Evertson, & C. S. Weinstein (Eds.), *Handbook of classroom management* (pp 407-437). Mahwah. NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates
- Ericsson, K., Krampe, R., & Tesch-Römer, C. (1993). The role of deliberate practice in the acquisition of expert performance.

Psychological Review, 100 (3), 363-406.

- Evans, L. (2002). What is teacher development? Oxford Review of *Education*, 28 (1), 123-137.
- Feiman-Nemser, S. (2003). What new teachers need to learn. *Educational Leadership*, 60, 25-29.
- Further Education and Training. (2013). Career development: Basic concepts and applications. Workshop training organized by The National Qualifications Framework (NQF) and Career Advice Services Helpline (CAS) in South Africa.
- Ganser, T. (2000). An ambitious vision of professional development for teachers. NASSP Bulletin, 84 (618), 6-12.

Gardner, H. (1991). The unschooled mind. New York: Basic Books.

- Gomes, A., & Mendes, A.J. (2007, June 14 15). An environment to improve programming education. Proceedings of the 2007 international conference on Computer systems and technologies, Bulgaria.
- Greenhaus, J. H. (2003). Career dynamics. In W. C. Bornman, D. R. Ilgen., and R. J. Klimoski (Eds.) *Handbook of psychology volume twelve: Industrial and organisational psychology*, (pp. 519-535). Hoboken (USA): John Wiley & Sons.
- Hall, C. (1996). Key teaching roles of a university lecturer and their integration into the quality systems of a New Zealand university. Assessment and Evaluation in Higher Education, 21 (2), 109-120.
- Huberman, M. A. (1989). The professional life cycle of teachers. *Teachers College Record*, *91* (1), 31-57.
- Jackson, C. K. (2009). Student demographics, teacher sorting, and teacher quality: Evidence from the end of school desegregation. *Journal of Labor Economics*, 27 (2), 213-256.
- Jackson, P. W. (1968). *Life in classrooms*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- Johri, A. (2006). Interpersonal assessment: Evaluating others in online learning environments. In T. Roberts (Ed.), Self, peer and group assessment in e-learning. Information Science Publishing: Hershey, PA.
- Kagan, D. M. (1992). Implication of research on teacher belief. *Educational Psychologist*, 27(1), 65-90.
- Kathpalia S. S. and Ling, K. S. (2007). Learning Communities in University Classrooms. *Reflections on English Language Teaching*, 6(1), 65-78.
- Kettle B., & Sellars, N. (1996). The development of student teachers practical theory of teaching. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 12(1), 1-24.
- Kohn, A. (1993). *Punished by rewards: The trouble with gold stars, incentive plans, A's, praise, and other bribes.* Boston, Mass: Houghton Mifflin.
- Kruse, S. D. & Louis, K. S. (1997). Teaching Teaming in Middle Schools: Dilemmas for a schoolwide community. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 33(3), 57-71.
- Kyriacou, C. (1986). *Effective teaching in schools*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.
- LaGrange College Education Department. (2009). Conceptual framework. LaGrange, GA: LaGrange College.
- McGill, I., & Brockbank, A. (2004). The action learning handbook. London: Routledge-Falmer.
- Murray, C. E. (1992). Teaching as a profession: The Rochester Case in historical perspective. *Harvard Educational Review*, 62 (4), 494-519.
- O'Donnell, A. M., Reeve, J., & Smith, J. K. (2012). *Educational psychology: Reflection for action (3rded.)*. Wiley, New York,

- Ofsted. (November, 2004). *Why colleges succeed*. © Crown copyright 2004, Document reference number: HMI 2409, Website: www.ofsted.gov.uk
- Pounder, D. G. (1999). Teacher teams: Exploring job characteristics and work-related outcomes of work group enhancement. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 35(3), 317-348.
- Rehman, H., & Khan, N. (2011). The flaws in Pakistan's education system. Abasyn Journal of Social Sciences, 4 (1).
- Reynolds, B. (1965). *Learning and teaching in the practice of social work* (2nd ed.). New York: Russell and Russell.
- Scales, P. (2008). *Teaching in the lifelong learning sector*. Berkshire: Open University Press.
- Shamatov, D. A. (2005). Beginning teachers' professional socialization in post-Soviet Kyrgyzstan: Challenges and coping strategies. Unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Toronto.
- Sparks, D., & Loucks-Horsley, S. (1989). Five models of staff development for teachers. *Journal of Staff Development*, 10 (4), 40-57.
- Strahan, D. B. (1990). A developmental analysis of pre-service teachers' orientations toward themselves, their studies, and their subject matter. *Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of* the American Educational Research Association, Boston.
- Thompson, A. (1998). Not the color purple: Black feminist lessons for educational caring. *Harvard Educational Review*, 68(4), 522-554.
- Wilson, E. K., Readence, J. E., & Konopak, B. C. (2002). Preservice and in-service secondary social studies teachers' beliefs and instructional decisions about learning with text. *Journal of Social Studies Research*, 26(1), 12-22.
- Woolfolk, A., Misra, G. & Jha, A. (2012). Fundamentals of educational psychology. New Delhi: Pearson.
- Woolfolk-Hoy, A., & Weinstein, C. S. (2006). Student and teacher perspectives on classroom management. In C. M. Evertson & C. S. Weinstein (Eds.), *Handbook of classroom management* (pp. 181–219). London: LEA.
- Yoon, K. S., Duncan, T., Lee, S. W., Scarloss, B., & Shapley, K. L. (2007). Reviewing the evidence on how teacher professional development affects student achievement. (Issues & Answers Report, REL 2007- No. 033). Washington, DC: US Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Education Evaluation and Regional Assistance, Regional Educational Laboratory Southwest.
- Young, P. (2001). District and state policy influences on professional development and school capacity. *Educational Policy*, *15* (2), 278-301.
- Zheng, H. (2015). Teacher beliefs as a complex system: English language teachers in China. Berlin, Germany: Springer International Publishing. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-23009-2.

Received: 12th March, 2017 Revisions Received: 10th April, 2018