Investigating Islamic Ideology in Benazir Bhutto's Reconciliation: A Critical Discourse Analysis

*Hafiz Abdul Haseeb Hakimi
**Naveed Ahmad Chaudhry
***Snobra Rizwan

Abstract

This paper investigates Islamic ideology in Benazir Bhutto's *Reconciliation*. It takes Fairclough's model of Critical Discourse Analysis (henceforth CDA) as analytical framework. This framework basically focuses on the vocabulary of Islamic texts excerpted from the aforementioned book. CDA of the texts reveals that Benazir Bhutto has endeavored to construct those aspects of Islamic ideology which support democratic system, gender egalitarianism and moderate interpretation of Islam. The analysis also reveals that Benazir Bhutto takes *Qur'ān* into account for the construction of Islamic ideology. Sunnah which is second main source of Islamic law has been overlooked. The purpose of constructing Islamic ideologies in this way appears to empower and strengthen Benazir Bhutto, democratic forces and Muslim women socially, politically and Islamicly and to enervate the dictators, monarchs and extremist Muslim clergy socially, politically and Islamicly in Pakistan and across the Muslim world.

Keywords: Critical Discourse Analysis, Islamic Ideology, Power Acquisition, Power Struggle, Social Practice.

Introduction:

Benazir Bhutto, a well-known political figure of Pakistan, incorporates Islamic ideology in her book *Reconciliation* to support and propagate her political beliefs and her belief in gender egalitarianism. This paper critically analyses the selected text to ascertain as to why Benazir Bhutto constructs Islamic ideology with a particular angle and if Islamic aspects of ideology presented in her book are creative or normative. The intertextuality analysis of the text has also been conducted to ascertain the Islamic sources of law. According to Abdulmajid[1]:

Ideologies often dominate the thoughts, perceptions and beliefs of a social group, which as a consequence, come to characterize that group in terms of identity, norms, values, resources, and goals.

It, therefore, becomes indispensable for the political players to generate such ideologies that can help them reach their goals and objectives. They influence and win the consent of general public in the incessant battle for power and position through their capability of constructing required ideologies. Teittinen [2]asserts:

The winner is a party whose language, words, terms and symbolic expressions are dominant once reality and the context have been defined.

---

*(Corresponding Author), Ph.D Scholar/Lecturer, Department of English, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan.
**Professor,Department of English, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan.
***Assistant Professor, Department of English, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan.

[1] Abdulmajid, Adib. "*Media and Ideology in the Middle East: A Critical Discourse Analysis*". Digest of Middle East Studies. (2019): 4.
[2] Teittinen, Mari. "*Power and persuasion in the Finnish presidential rhetoric in the early 1990's*". Retrieved April 18, (2018) http://www/natcom./org/conferences/Finland/Mari Teittinen.(2018): 74.

Islamic Ideology (The Authority of Sunnah):

To investigate Islamic ideology in the context of said book, it is inevitable to discuss traditional Islamic ideology. To understand Islamic ideology, we need to know that in Islam there are two main sources of guidance, i.e. the Holy *Qur'ān* and the Sunnah of the Holy Prophet Muhammad (PBUH). The *Qur'ān* and the Sunnah of Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) are correlated. They are thoroughly compatible with each other. The Holy *Qur'ān*[3] says:

Say, if ye do love Allah, follow me: Allah will love you and forgive you your sins: for Allah is Oft-Forgiving, Most Merciful. Say, obey Allah and His Messenger. But if they turn back, Allah loveth not those who reject Faith.

These two verses of the Holy *Qur'ān* explicitly enjoin the Muslims to follow and obey Allah Almighty and His Messenger Muhammad (PBUH). The Prophet (PBUH) said[4]: "I am leaving among you two sources (of guidance). You will go astray until you stick to them. They are the Book of Allah and Sunnah of His Prophet (PBUH)". Imam Malik is frequently quoted as saying, 'the Sunnah is the ark of Noah. Whoever boards it is saved, and whoever remains away perishes'[5] .

The term '*Sunnah'* is defined as 'a word spoken or an act done or a confirmation given by the Holy Prophet Muhammad (PBUH)'[6]. The Glorious *Qur'ān* thoroughly discusses the obligations of the Holy Prophet (PBUH). Usmani [7] summarizes the functions of the Holy Prophet (PBUH):

I.   The Holy Prophet (PBUH) is the authority who can guide the people how to recite the Glorious Book.
II.   His interpretation of the Glorious book is unquestionable.
III. Wisdom based on divine guidance can only be learnt from the Prophet(PBUH)

It is to be noted that the above functions of Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) will not be materialized if oral and practical teachings of the Holy Prophet are not held authoritative by his followers. Usmani[8] quotes several verses from the Glorious *Qur'ān* to prove that obedience of the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) is as significant and vital as the obedience of Allah Almighty to practice true Islam. According to Usmani[9], *Qur'ān* warns the believers not to disobey the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) because his disobedience is equal to the disobedience of God Himself. According to Usmani:[10]

When a Prophet bids something or forbids something, he does not do it in his private capacity, rather, he does so in the capacity of a messenger of Allah".

It is significant to note that in the whole *Qur'ān*, there is not even a single verse which enjoins believers to obey God only and there is no reference to the obedience of the Messenger Muhammad in the same verse e.g "And obey Allah and the Messenger so that you

---

[3] Ali, Allama Abdullah Yusuf." The Holy *Qur'ān* with English Translation".Qudrat Ullah Co. Gunj Bukhsh Road Lahore, (1934): 79-80.
[4]Malik, Imam and Anas,Ibn.' *Al-Muwattaof Imam Malik' ibn Anas. (*London and New York: Routledge Taylor and Francis Group, 2010).
[5]Ibid.
[6]Usmani, Mufti Muhammad Taqi. "*The Authority of Sunnah"*. (Karachi: Urdu Bazar M.A Jinnah Road, Idaratul *Qur'ān* Wal Uloomil Islami, 2004).
[7] Ibid
[8] Ibid
[9] Ibid
[10] Ibid 16.

may be blessed" [11] On the other hand , we can find some verses in the Glorious *Qur'ān* which direct the believers to obey the Messenger without any direction that believers should obey the Almighty because according to *Qur'ān*, the obedience of the Messenger is actually the obedience of God Himself.

To conclude, followers of the religion must understand that the Prophet (PBUH) is the representative of God. His obedience means the obedience of God (Allah) and the reference to the former certainly includes the latter. This is the reason the Glorious *Qur'ān* in its several verses has just referred to the obedience of the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) only because obeying the Prophet is the practical way of obeying Allah.

Research Questions:

In the context above-given discussion, the present study seeks to explore following research questions:

Main Questions:

1. How does Benazir Bhutto construct Islamic ideology in her book *Reconciliation*?
2. What linguistic resources does she employ to construct religious ideology to support gender egalitarianism and democracy?

Sub Questions

i. Are the aspects of Islamic ideology constructed by Benazir Bhutto normative or creative?
ii. Which sources of Islamic law does Benazir Bhutto take into account to support different aspects of her Islamic ideology?

It is hypothesized that, in *Reconciliation*, Islam, democracy and the West, Benazir Bhutto constructs those aspect of ideology which support her political and social beliefs. Besides this, the Islamic aspects of her ideology are non-normative and creative. For the construction of desired aspects of Islamic ideology, she does not take into account the second source of Islamic law, i.e. *Sunnah*.

Literature Review:

"Discourse is generally defined as a system of texts, including spoken or written language, cultural artifacts and visual representations that bring about objects through production, dissemination, and consumption".[12]

Waring thoroughly discusses what the discourse is. He asserts that by discourse we mean actual use of language in the real social life.[13] A very popular dichotomy which has been created in the area of discourse analysis is between small "d" discourse and capital "D" discourse[14]. The small letter 'd' discourse basically refers to "any instance of language-in use" (written or spoken)[15], while the capital 'D' discourses " ways of combining and integrating language actions, interactions, ways of thinking, believing, value, and using various symbols, tools, and objects to an act a particular sort of socially recognizable

---

[11]Ibid 10.

[12] Abdulmajid, Abid. "Media and Ideology in the Middle East: A Critical Discourse Analysis". Digest of Middle East Studies (2019): 6.

[13] Waring, Hansun Zhang. "*Discourse analysis: The questions discourse analysts ask and how they answer them*". (New York and London: Routledge, 2018).

[14] Gee, James Paul. "*An introduction to discourse analysis: Theory and method*". (London and New York: Routledge, 2011).

[15] Ibid, 205.

identity" [16]. It can be asserted that "discourse refers to the actual use of language along with other multimodal resources (e.g., facial expression, gazes, gestures, body movements, artifacts, and the material settings) to accomplish actions, negotiate identities, and construct ideologies"[17].

Critical discourse analysis (CDA) is a form of critical social analysis which focuses upon relations between discourse and other aspects of social life. Waring[18] is of the view that the function of critical discourse analysis is to investigate the relationship which exists between the language humans speak and the power humans seek through it. Critical discourse analysts analyze both the meanings and use of language in historical, ideological and political perspective. They critically examine the discourses which play a role in naturalizing and legitimizing dominance, power, discrimination, racism and gender inequality in the given society. For this purpose, they use various existing and new methods which include ethnographic research, case studies and large scale analysis of corpora.

To further explicate the term CDA, it is added that CDA considers both talk and text as discourse which is basically a type of social practice. The belief that discourse is a social practice means that a specific discursive event and the social structures, situations and institutions that frame it have dialectical relationship. It also means that a dialectical relationship involves a two way relation. Social situations, societal institution and social structures shape these discursive events and are also shaped by them. Discursive practices can generate large scale ideological effects because they are capable of producing and reproducing unjust relations of power between different ethnic groups, men and women, and social classes by positioning people and representing things according to the given agenda. For instance, discourses may be sexist or even racist. They can propagate false assumptions as common sense targeting some particular aspects of the social life. "Both the ideological loading of particular ways of using language and the relations of power which underlie them are often unclear to people. CDA aims to make more visible these opaque aspects of discourse" [19].

CDA should not be viewed as an objective and impartial social science but as dedicated and engaged. Its function is to intervene in masses' social relationships and social practices. Many analysts can be seen to be active politically as feminists, or working for peace movements, or fighting against racism and so forth.

Theoretical Framework:

For critical discourse analysis of the text, this paper takes insight from Fairclough's[20] analytical framework. The analysis mainly focuses on vocabulary of the texts. Following Fairclough[21], this study analyzes the text at three stages:

- Description
- Interpretation
- Explanation

Stage one which is called descriptive stage analyzes the text for experiential, relational and expressive values of words. It also analyzes the text for its use of metaphors

---

[16] Ibid, 201.
[17] Waring, Hansun Zhang. *"Discourse Analysis"*. (New York and London: Routledge Taylor and Francis Group, 2018), 8.
[18] Ibid
[19] Fairclough, Norman. *"Language and Power"*. (New York: Routledge, 2015), 258.
[20] Ibid.
[21] Ibid.

because "different metaphors have different ideological attachments[22]". Explicating experiential values of words, Fairclough[23] posits "Experiential value is a trace of and a cue to the way in which the text producer's experience of the natural or social world is represented. Experiential value is to do with contents, knowledge and beliefs". It includes the analysis of lexical items, collocations, word frequencies and the meaning relations of synonymy, antonymy and hyponymy between words. Explicating relational values of words, Fairclough[24] postulates, "A formal feature with relational value is a trace of and a cue to the social relationships which are enacted via the text in the discourse. Relational value is (transparently) to do with relations and social relationships". It includes the analysis of the words chosen by the author for relational purpose, use of euphemism to avoid negative value and the level of formality in the selection of words.

Explicating expressive values of words, Fairclough[25] theorizes, "A formal feature with expressive value is a trace of and a cue to the producer's evaluation of the bit of the reality it relates to. Expressive value is to do with subjects and social identities". It includes the analysis of evaluative words and persuasive language used by the text producers to shape identities and portray specific social characters. At description stage, the text has also been analyzed to find out if the author has used metaphors because "metaphor is a means of representing one aspect of experience in terms of another".[26]

At stage two, which is called interpretation stage, this research analyzes the text to determine situational, institutional and societal settings. Contents of the text were analyzed to know the purpose of the text, involvement of the subjects, their social position and power relations with one another. It also analyzed the role, genre and the channel of the language. "Interpretations are generated through a combination of what is in the text and what is 'in' the interpreter, in the sense of the members' resources (MR) which the latter brings to interpretation"[27].

At stage three, which is called explanation stage, this research analyzed social determinants to investigate what power relations at societal, institutional and situational levels which assisted in shaping the specific discourse and which elements of MR (member resources) the text producer drew upon might have the ideological character. Next, the text was analyzed to investigate if the discourse was normative or creative with respect to the MR and whether it made any contribution in sustaining the existing relations of power or transformed them by generating ideologies. Keeping in view all this, the social functions of ideologies were determined in the text.

The data for the present research comprises selected extracts from Benazir Bhutto's 'Reconciliation: Islam, Democracy and the West 'collected through purposive sampling.

---

[22] Ibid, 137.
[23] Ibid, 130.
[24] Ibid,
[25] Ibid, 130.
[26] Ibid, 136
[27] Ibid, 155

Analysis

Extract-1

"Islam is not the caricature that is often portrayed in Western media………. democratic institutions and democratic governance".[28]

Description Stage:

Starting with the classification scheme of lexis, the analysis of this text denotes that the content is about the characteristics and social principles of Islam which are similar to those of democracy. The words Islam, open, pluralistic, consensus, consultation and judgment are relevant to understand the content. Use of the Arabic terms e.g shura (consultation), ijma (building consensus) and ijtihad (independent judgment) indicate Benazir Bhutto's wide knowledge of Islam. Frequent use of the word *democratic* reveals Benazir Bhutto's firm belief in democratic system of government.

This text has used several collocations to show Benazir Bhutto's strong belief in the religion of Islam and democracy. The collocations tolerant religion, positive force, Islamic populations, democratic principles, democratic institutions and democratic governance are notable in this respect. Fairclough suggests quantitative analysis of the text to understand the focus of author's ideological struggle. Analysis of this text shows that Benazir Bhutto as used the word democratic three times in this text while each of the words religion and Islam has been used two times.[29]

The words Islam, caricature, Western, United States, Europe indicate that the author is struggling to establish relation with international community to remove their misconceptions about Islam. To emphasize her point of view, Benazir Bhutto avoids the use of euphemisms in this specific text. Use of the word caricature is in this respect. However the author has carefully selected formal vocabulary for relational value. The words tolerant, pluralistic, populations and principles are the instances of formal vocabulary used in this text to establish a formal and honorable relation with international community. Besides this, the whole discourse is formal because there is no repetition of words. The text does not contain broken or incomplete sentences and it is properly punctuated. Fairclough believes that the positive or negative portrayals of the subjects are linked to the construction of Ideologies. In this text, Western media has been portrayed as dishonest and deceitful institution. Islam has been portrayed as a just, tolerant and pluralistic religion. While Benazir Bhutto has been portrayed as a democrat and Islamic scholar with wide knowledge of religion as she uses carefully selected words to evaluate the religion of Islam.[30]

Metaphors: Metaphors show idiosyncratic style of an author. According to Fairclough[31], they have different ideological attachments. The analysis shows that Benazir Bhutto has used a metaphor in this text. She calls Islam a positive force. It produces the ideology that extremists and terrorists who are involved in negative activities of killing innocent human beings do not represent Islam because Islam is a positive force.

Interpretation Stage:

The passage is a religio-political text. In this text, Benazir Bhutto struggles to remove the misconceptions of international community about Islam after 9/11 catastrophe of

---

[28] Bhutto, Benazir. "Reconciliation: Islam, Democracy, and the West". (New York: Harper Collins, 2008), 30.

[29] Fairclough, Norman. "Language and Power". (New York: Routledge, 2015).

[30] Ibid

[31] Ibid

twin towers. So the topic of this discourse is Positive Portrayal of Islam. The purpose is to tell the international forces that all Muslims do not believe in the extremist interpretation of Islam given by Al-Qaeda and Taliban and Islam is compatible with democracy because both have similar characteristics.

This text involves Benazir Bhutto and international community respectively. The analysis indicates that B.B's role is multi- dimensional in this text. She takes the subject positions of a representative Muslim Scholar, a lawyer and a democrat simultaneously when she uses and discusses specific Islamic terms to defend Islam and show its similarities with democracy. International community takes the subject position of judges and justices who have to decide if Benazir Bhutto is right or wrong in her point of view. In this relation judges are obviously more powerful than the lawyer. This imbalanced power relation is also a reason of social distance between the two parties. In this text, the role of the language is defensive and argumentative. The author uses it as an instrument to defend Islam and to argue that Islam is compatible with democracy. This topic of the text determines its genre i.e religio-political text in written form as far as its channel is concerned.

Explanation Stage:
In this text Benazir Bhutto uses original Islamic terminology to defend Islam. It generates the normative ideology that international community should not consider Taliban and Al-Qaeda the true or actual face of Islam after 9/11 tragedy. In Muslim community, there are other groups who believe in moderate Islamic approach and interpret Islam differently. They can play their role to exterminate extremism and restore world peace. International community should support and empower these groups for the restoration of peace worldwide.

The analysis denotes that Benazir Bhutto has developed creative ideologies at institutional level (as far as the institution of democracy is concerned) to bring about change in power dynamics in Pakistani society. By showing similarities between Islam and democracy, Benazir Bhutto struggles to construct the ideology that the segments of Muslim political groups who oppose democracy and raise slogans of Islamic caliphate or back dictatorship in Islamic countries have extremist mental approach. International community should discourage and disapprove them. On the other hand, political leaders with democratic approach are Islamicly moderate as the point of view of Benazir Bhutto in the text indicates. They shun extremism and condemn ever increasing terrorism world-wide due to their mild and soft interpretation of Islam. In this regard institution of democracy or democratic system of government is suitable for Muslim counties. Therefore international community (particularly America) should stop assisting dictators and hardliners. They should support Benazir Bhutto who is insignia of democracy.

At societal level Benazir Bhutto produces creative gender ideology that only males of Muslim societies do not have the right to talk about religion and give Islamic verdicts. Their verdicts are always influenced by their patriarchal approach. A woman Islamic scholar with wide understanding of religion should have the right to give Islamic verdicts which are void of male prejudices. Benazir Bhutto being female Islamic scholar issues the verdict that Islam and democracy due to similarities between them can co-exist. Mullah's verdict that democracy and Islam cannot co-exist is prejudiced because they do not want Benazir Bhutto to come into power through democratic election in Pakistan.

Extract 2:
> "Quite remarkably and uniquely……… like this in any religion on earth" [32]

Description Stage:

The analysis of the lexical items and collocations classifies the discourse as Islamic text. The words *Qur'ān*, religions, salvation, God and the collocation Holy Book are significant in this respect. Benazir Bhutto also presents *Qur'ān*ic view about the status of Christians, Jews and Sabians in the Hereafter by quoting word for word translation of *Qur'ān*ic verse. Vocabulary analysis denotes Benazir Bhutto's wide knowledge of *Qur'ān* and her belief in Islamic pluralism.

Quantitative analysis reveals that in this text of ninety- six words (which also includes *Qur'ān*ic quotation of forty- five words) , Benazir Bhutto uses the word religion three times while the word salvation has been used two times. Frequent use of these two words generates the ideology that unlike male Muslim scholars, a female scholar is generous enough to present an unusual interpretation of Islam which guarantees the salvation of followers of religions other than Islam.

Use of the words Jews, Christians Sabians and salvation indicates that Benazir Bhutto is struggling to establish relation of friendship and interfaith harmony with international community particularly with the followers of aforementioned religions. Her verdict that theses religions can also lead to salvation makes this bond of interfaith harmony even stronger. Coming to the use of euphemisms, this text does not need the use of euphemisms for relational reasons due to the nature of its topic. Turning to the use of formal vocabulary for relational values, the words Holy Book, acknowledges, embraces, salvation, humanity and God are significant.

Turning to the expressive values of the words for the portrayal of positive or negative social identities of the subjects, Benazir Bhutto uses positive vocabulary for followers of other religions. Her embracing and pluralistic approach that religions other than Islam can lead to salvation portrays her as a champion of interfaith harmony in the eyes of international community. On the other hand, use of positive vocabulary changes the identity of non-Muslims who (Jews, Christians and Sabians) are viewed as infidels or pagans (Kafirs) by mainstream Muslim community. Their identity changes form infidels to followers who like Muslims have the equal right to enter the gardens of paradise. The analysis indicates that there is no explicit use of metaphors. However, Benazir Bhutto has made implicit use of metaphors in this text. For example, *Qur'ān* becomes the metaphor of Islamic pluralism in this text while Benazir Bhutto is the metaphor of interfaith harmony.

Interpretation Stage:

In this text**,** Benazir Bhutto endeavors to remove the misconceptions of international community that Islam is against pluralism. So the topic of this text is interfaith harmony. The purpose is to tell Americans and Europeans who are apparently distracted by 9/11 tragedy that Taliban and Al Qaeda groups are following politicized Islam that is void of its true spirit and nature. The text first of all involves the author (Benazir Bhutto) who assumes different subject position in comparison with the target readers. She appears as a representative Muslim mediator, a scholar or Mufti who is capable enough to quote relevant verses from the Holy Book of Islam to avoid cultural clash between Islam and the west.

---

[32] Bhutto, Benazir. "Reconciliation: Islam, Democracy, and the West". (New York: Harper Collins Publishers, 2008), 31.

Her verdict that other religions can also lead to salvation raises her to the position of social and Islamic reformer. The target readers take the subject position of Benazir Bhutto's allies in the war against Islamic extremism. In this relation, no one is struggling to gain power rather Benazir Bhutto and the allies strive to support each other against Islamic extremists. Here the role of language is that of a mediator. It is being used for mediation between different faiths. This role of language determines that it belongs to the genre of Islamic text whose channel is written.

Explanation Stage:

After 9/11 catastrophe, Benazir Bhutto generates normative ideology that all segments of Muslim society do not have the mind-set like Al-Qaeda and Taliban who attacked Twin towers under extremist and politicized interpretation of Islam. Muslim societies have scholars like Benazir Bhutto who interpret Islam on humanitarian basis. They accept that all religions lead to salvation Therefore International community should support and promote leaders like Benazir Bhutto who can play their role in the development of moderate Islamic approach and the resultant restoration of world peace. The fact that Benazir Bhutto is a Pakistani political leader and Islamic scholar further enhances her significance because Pakistan is allegedly a safe haven for terrorist groups.

At institutional level, Benazir Bhutto generates creative ideology that only dictators, their allies and state sponsored mullahs are the root cause of extremism and terrorism in Pakistan and all around the world. Democratic forces in Pakistan have different Islamic approach. They detest extremism and terrorism. Benazir Bhutto's interpretation of Islam is a proof in this respect. Her interpretation develops Islamic pluralism among the people of different faiths. International community should therefore strengthen the institution of democracy in Pakistan to exterminate extremism and terrorism all around the world.

In the given text, Benazir Bhutto gives her Islamic point of view that all religions including Judaism, Christianity and Sabianism lead to salvation. Therefore, it is not obligatory for humans to accept Islam to enter the gardens of paradise. Benazir Bhutto includes a verse form *Qur'ān* for her Islamic point of view in this text but she does not quote the dictum of Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) in this respect. Benazir Bhutto's Islamic verdict also generates the ideology that masses should not always look at mullahs and Muslim clergy for Islamic guidance. Women (Benazir Bhutto) and the people other than mullahs can also guide them in Islamic matters.

Discussion:

Critical discourse analysis of the selected discourses from the book Reconciliation reveals that Ms. Bhutto has constructed those aspects of religious ideology which might justify the compatibility of democracy with Islam and gender egalitarianism in a Muslim society because these aspects of religious ideology which Benazir Bhutto has struggled to construct might ultimately enable her to reach corridors of power in Pakistan. Her endeavor to construct the ideology after 9/11 catastrophe that democrats are enlightened moderate people while dictators are hardliners and supporters of Taliban and Al-Qaeda extremists is meant to seek support from the international community for the restoration of democracy in Pakistan because it is democracy which can change power dynamics in Pakistan and pave for her the way to power corridors. CDA of the texts also reveals an important aspect of Benazir Bhutto's religious ideology that women can also issue religious verdicts. So it is again linked to power dynamics. This ideology basically enervates the mullahs who, through their verdicts, supported dictators, opposed democracy and women's public roles and rule in Pakistan. It can be observed that the ultimate purpose of this ideology is to change power dynamics by

changing the mindset of the masses that it is not the prerogative of mullahs only to control masses through their verdicts.

CDA also denotes Benazir Bhutto's construction of creative ideology against Islamic caliphate. Construction of this creative ideology is again linked to power dynamics in Pakistan because if the system of caliphate is implemented, Benazir Bhutto and other democrats will not be able to come into power. Another significant aspect of Benazir Bhutto's religious ideology is her assertion that all religions including Judaism, Christianity and Sabianism can lead to Salvation. This aspect of religious ideology is again linked to power dynamics. It portrays Benazir Bhutto as a broad minded, soft hearted and moderate Muslim leader in the eyes of International community and super powers who always play their role in establishing or toppling governments in Pakistan. Intertextuality analysis also reveals that Benazir Bhutto quotes only *Qur'ān*ic verse to support the above ideology.

CDA of the texts frequently denotes that Benazir Bhutto has constructed some creative or non-normative religious ideologies to shape her identity as an enlightened moderate person so that she may attract the attention of international forces after 9/11 catastrophe for the restoration of democracy. For this, she deviates from the established interpretation of Islam as discussed in the section 'Islamic Ideology'. Her ideology that all religions including Judaism, Christianity and Sabianism lead to salvation is again linked to the struggle of changing power dynamics in Pakistan.

Another aspect of religious ideology is that *Qur'ān*ic guidance is sufficient for the implementation of gender egalitarianism and for the elimination of discrimination against women in Muslim societies. Sunnah does not meet the demands of modern era. Only *Qur'ān*ic education should be made compulsory for the Muslim masses and education of Sunnah must be abandoned because Sunnah of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) minutely discusses the commandments of the religion and very strictly codifies the laws and rules of social life which might stop women from playing their public roles. This ideology is again linked to the change of power dynamics in the patriarchal society.

Conclusion:

Perusal and the CDA of Benazir Bhutto's Reconciliation reveals that Benazir Bhutto who was a polished politician and true devotee of democracy has constructed these aspects of Islamic ideology just to reduce the influence of mullahs and Islamic bigots on Muslim societies and to enervate the dictators and monarch who always misuse religion to strengthen themselves. It also appears that she has constructed these aspects of Islamic ideology under compulsion just to vitiate the Islamic influence of extremist groups of Taliban and Al-Qaeda on the masses of Pakistan, to convince the world community after 9/11 catastrophe that Benazir Bhutto and her political party represent the enlightened moderate league of Muslim community and to deconstruct the Islamic ideologies propagated by dictator controlled mullahs against women's social emancipation, women's public roles and a woman's rule as head of the Muslim state. It also appears that Benazir Bhutto has made untraditional and creative interpretation of Islam just to change power dynamics in Muslim world. (See section Islamic Ideology) These creative aspects of ideology might be due to her inadequate Islamic knowledge and deficiency of proper education form Islamic educational institutions (as her autobiography denotes)[33]. Her emphasis on *Qur'ān*ic guidance only during the intertextuality analysis of the texts indicates her untraditional Islamic ideology which has been generated to empower democrats and women in the Muslim world.

---

[33] Bhutto, Benazir. "Daughter of Destiny". (New York: Harper Collins Publishers, 2008).